



CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL

MEETING MINUTES

February 27, 2020

9:30 AM

Point Blue Conservation Science, Palomarin Room, Petaluma, CA

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the meeting of the Sanctuary Advisory Council for Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS). The council is an advisory body to the sanctuary superintendent. The opinions and findings of this publication do not necessarily reflect the position of CBNMS and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

Call to Order/Roll Call (Bec Detrich)

Bec Detrich, Advisory Council Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:30 AM and welcomed everyone. Lilli Ferguson, advisory council coordinator, then called roll.

Nongovernmental Members Present:

Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large - Marin County)
Tom Anderson (Community-at-Large - Sonoma County)
Steve Tubbs (Community-at-Large – Sonoma County)
Scott Artis (Conservation)
Irma Cuevas (Education)
Bec Detrich (Chair; Education)
Dick Ogg (Vice-Chair; Fishing)
Noah Wagner (Fishing)
Tessa Hill (Research)
Jaime Jahncke (Research)

Agency Member Present:

Special Agent Dan Glick (NOAA Fisheries)
LCDR Lee Crusius (United States Coast Guard [USCG])

Members of the CBNMS staff present:

Danielle Lipski (Sanctuary Superintendent [acting] and Research Coordinator)
Dan Howard (Sanctuary Superintendent [not acting at this meeting])
Lilli Ferguson (Resource Protection Specialist and advisory council coordinator)
Jennifer Stock (Education and Outreach Coordinator)
Michael Carver (Deputy Superintendent and Resource Protection Coordinator)
Rachel Pound (Research Operational Specialist [NOAA Affiliate])

Special Agent Dan Glick introduced himself and said a few words about how he is relatively new to NOAA – he has been here seven or eight months – and that he was a federal agent with the Department of State.

Review and Approve Agenda (Bec)

The Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council (CBNMSAC) reviewed the agenda. Lilli mentioned a few changes. Danielle Lipski [acting] is doing the Sanctuary Superintendent's Report instead of Dan Howard. After Kathy Broughton's name, "[invited]" should be removed, as she will be speaking at this meeting. In the program reports agenda item, the extra "i" in Danielle's name needs to be removed. With those changes, the CBNMSAC unanimously approved the agenda.

Review and Approve August and November Meeting Minutes (Bec)

- The advisory council reviewed the August 22, 2019 meeting minutes and the November 22, 2019 meeting minutes and unanimously approved both.

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report (Dani)

- Dani noted she would give the report and that Dan wanted to say a few words.
- Dan started back to work the week before this meeting, working half time for two weeks and is working with Dani during the transition. She will act for Dan [as needed when he is not acting] through the end of March and she is sitting in the seat for the Superintendent for this meeting. He thanked the staff and the advisory council for keeping everything going. He has been gone since early July.
- Dani went over other recent staff transitions. Carol Bernthal, who was acting Superintendent from the end of September to early January, is back in her role at Olympic Coast National Marine Sanctuary. Dani became acting Superintendent January 6. Jenny Stock is back from a nine month detail as Chief of Interpretation at Point Reyes National Seashore. CBNMS lost its onsite Internet Technology support person, who was in the office one day a week; that function has moved to someone at the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) West Coast Region, who will manage similar functions for the region. There will not be as much support onsite at CBNMS. There has been a lot of change for us this past year and she is proud of the staff for navigating it.
- On the Fiscal Year (FY) 20 CBNMS budget, there is not much to update. The CBNMS request was submitted in September; most of the budget goes to federal and contract labor and a small amount to program area priorities, travel and office upkeep. The federal budget has been passed and signed but the sanctuary sites have not gotten their allocations yet. There is a process to allocate it from the department level to its parts, and things like NOAA overhead, a staff salaries going up, etc. that take time to figure out.
- In early December, CBNMS staff members participated in an earthquake drill with Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS) and Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS) staff members, looking at responses and staff coordination during that kind of disaster. The scenario was an earthquake off Monterey Bay, so the MBNMS folks were affected more, and the CBNMS role was more of a supporting one. There were a number of lessons learned about communicating, especially when people do not have access to email, etc.
- Rear Admiral Tim Gallaudet visited the CBNMS office in December. Dani was not there, other staff members met with him and took him to the Point Reyes National Seashore Lighthouse and visitor center. As the Assistant Secretary of Commerce for Oceans and Atmosphere and Deputy NOAA Administrator, he is the second in command at NOAA. He likes to connect with people and learn what they are doing "on the ground."
- All of the federal CBNMS staff will be at a training in Monterey in March to learn more about how business is done within ONMS, learning about time and attendance, procurement, etc. The training is to ensure everyone has the same awareness about the policies. Some other sanctuaries' staff will also attend.
- CBNMS has been making progress on its work with the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation on priority topics and working together.
- She then reviewed the status of designations and proposed national marine sanctuaries. Mallovs Bay was designated. Lake Ontario and Wisconsin-Lake Michigan are proposed. She passed around some handouts about where those two are in the proposed designation process and gave the highlights. The proposed Lake Ontario site has a Sanctuary Advisory Council to make recommendations to NOAA regarding management of that area. The Wisconsin-Lake Michigan nomination was stalled for a while, then in 2019, the Wisconsin governor announced support for it. The Final Environmental Impact Statement (EIS), final management plan and final rule all went to state of Wisconsin for review and an announcement may be made in the Federal Register April, followed by a 30-day "cooling off period" and final rule publication; it may be designated by summer.

Updating the CBNMS Condition Report (Kathy)

- Dani introduced Kathy, who works at ONMS headquarters, in the science division; she works on Condition Reports at all the sites. She and Dani will be working closely together on the process to update the CBNMS Condition Report.
- Kathy said Dani would be updating the CBNMSAC along the way on progress. This presentation is an overview of the process and major milestones to be hit along the way.
- All sites have developed an initial Condition Report of the status and trends of the resources within a given site. For CBNMS the first one was published in 2009 (before the CBNMS expansion). A Condition Report is meant to be a tool to use during a site's management plan update process and is to be released to the public before starting a management plan process to inform and educate people. Some sites have done, or are working on, a second Condition Report.
- Condition Reports have also been used by the sanctuaries' education and outreach folks, along with shorter summaries, and they have been used as a reporting mechanism to NOAA and Congress, regarding the status of the resources and achieving the sanctuaries' missions.
- ONMS has mapped out a schedule. The hope is to have the CBNMS Condition Report done by 2022.
- Only one person in the room acknowledged being part of the process to create the initial CBNMS report.
- The Condition Report structure now uses this model: Driving forces, Pressures, State, Ecosystem Services and Response (DPSER).
- A new section will describe the status and trends of sanctuary ecosystem services (an economics term). The final section is a response section, which summarizes management actions in place. It does not recommend or suggest changes to management.
- Topics related to pressures or drivers that may be covered include harvesting, vessel traffic, noise, climate, marine debris, and invasive species; they may also change for the upcoming report.
- Kathy went over sixteen questions that each report provides responses for, with ratings for status and trends from good to poor. There are definitions for each of the status ratings, and the trends are: improving, not changing, worsening, undetermined, and not applicable.
- She went over changes in the questions since the 2009 CBNMS Condition Report. They are on human dimensions, water quality, habitat, living resources, and maritime heritage resources.
- This round of reports includes confidence scores, done for each status and trend rating. Evidence plus agreement equals confidence.
- She briefly showed the 2009 CBNMS ratings.
- The ecosystem services content will attempt to capture – cultural or non-material benefits, provisioning or materials benefits, and regulating or buffering to change services.
- The response section will summarize existing efforts, including things such as policy, enforcement, resource protection, monitoring and research, and education and outreach.
- The CBNMS Condition Report update process has now kicked off via a meeting with the staff and this meeting. She reviewed how the rest of the process was planned to go between the rest of 2020 and 2022. Indicator identification, data gathering, vetting with experts, and some report drafting is planned for 2020. A status and trends workshop and more report drafting is in the plan for 2021, along with three levels of review, which will go until 2022. Likely the advisory council will be part of an invited review – details to be worked out. It is hoped the final Condition Report will be released in fall 2022. A review of the CBNMS Management Plan would follow.
- She noted the ONMS web page has a section where all the published reports are posted.
- In response to a question about ecosystem services, she reaffirmed the information would look only at trends from 2009 to the present and would not be forward thinking. There may be an opportunity to note emerging issues in the report.
- There was a question about how sense of place would be gauged. Kathy noted that varied from location to location, was meant to be a sense of place among all community segments, and would be done by the ONMS staff members versed in economics services (or, the question could be dropped).
- She passed around the Channel Island National Marine Sanctuary Condition Report as one example of such a report. The amount of data and other information each sanctuary site wants to include will be up to

the sites. The Stellwagen Bank National Marine Sanctuary Condition Report was briefer than the Channel Islands one.

- There was a question about what data sources would be used to estimate harvest rates, and if recreational fishing would be included. Kathy said recreation was pulled out separately in ecosystem services and the ONMS economists would know better than she about data sources. She said that the workshop to vet data and data sources with experts would help in determining if the right data sets were being used.
- Are categories chosen because of existing data sources, or is data collected to inform the report? Dani responded they try to gather data that can inform status and trends questions for use in sanctuary management, and the questions are used for all sanctuaries in the system, so there was not always a perfect match between the questions and available data.
- How can trends be measured over time if the same study has not been done over time or there is no data set for a question? Kathy answered this could be addressed in the confidence rating or the response could say the data to answer the question was very limited. A narrative can also highlight data gaps.

Advisory Council Roles, Process, and Communications (Martha McCoy)

- Lilli mentioned that Martha (“Marty”) McCoy is an Attorney-Advisor with the NOAA Office of the General Counsel, Oceans and Coasts Section, and is assigned to work on CBNMS matters.
- Marty joined the meeting virtually, via telephone. She wanted to review guidance for advisory councils on their roles and communications, much of which is drawn from the ONMS Sanctuary Implementation Handbook.
- The role of an advisory council, under the National Marine Sanctuaries Act, is, as a body, to provide advice and recommendations to the sanctuary superintendent as delegated [by the Secretary of Commerce] on issues pertaining to management or designation of the sanctuary. Advisory councils are a valuable and important way for sanctuary management to be informed by stakeholder and constituent perspectives.
- Participants have special functions and status, and their service is considered service on behalf of the U.S. government. Because advisory councils’ authorities come from NOAA, there are some conduct restrictions similar to those for federal employees, including conduct outside of advisory councils. Some guidance applies to the communications of the advisory council as a body and some applies to the communications of individual members [and alternates].
- Any written or verbal advice, correspondence or information from the advisory council as a body to the Superintendent must be voted on and approved by both the advisory council and the superintendent and must be on advisory council letterhead with a disclaimer (guidance on that in the handbook).
- Sanctuary Advisory Councils do not advise external parties or entities and their advice should be on relevant matters pertinent to sanctuary management. In addition, an advisory council cannot speak on behalf of the sanctuary, ONMS, or NOAA.
- There is a special protocol that applies if there is a desire to provide advice externally, say to a local, state or other agency. Any advice, correspondence or information the council wishes to offer or express beyond the superintendent must be voted on and approved by both the advisory council and the superintendent prior to sending, and must be sent on advisory council letterhead. They may discuss the method of transmittal together, though the method is subject to the superintendent's discretion.
- As a general matter, federal agencies are prohibited from engaging in lobbying activities and because advisory councils derive their authority from NOAA, there are additional process restrictions on communications to Congress. As private citizens, individual advisory council members are not prohibited from contacting members of Congress on their concerns as private citizens. The advisory council cannot lobby or send correspondence to Congress; however, if a member of Congress makes an inquiry to the advisory council, it may respond after coordinating with the superintendent. An advisory council may make a recommendation to NOAA [via the superintendent] concerning NOAA legislation.
- Regarding the media, before any remarks from the advisory council as a body are made to the media, they must be coordinated with the superintendent, including providing any position or talking points to

the superintendent and advisory council coordinator in advance. As private citizens, individuals may speak to the media on any topic.

- On individual communications of advisory council members [and alternates] on sanctuary issues, people must distinguish among positions adopted by the advisory council as a body and individual positions. No one may communicate for the advisory council as a body unless the advisory council has approved that.
- No individual can seek to profit by his or her position on the advisory council. For example, a member may not use the advisory council affiliation or spend advisory council time to fundraise, including fundraising for other organizations of which the individual is a part. Advisory Councils may not solicit funds. Advisory councils may not endorse one external group over another at advisory council meetings or otherwise on advisory council time. Individuals may not leverage their special position or status on an advisory council to benefits other roles they might serve. As an individual, a person may join other organizations and solicit donations on their own time, just not on advisory council time.
- If an advisory council member [or alternate] wants to express a personal opinion on a sanctuary issue, he or she should not reference his/her advisory council title or being part of the advisory council; an exception is one may reference it if part of a general biographical description of other information is also included (for example, as part of a speaker biography when speaking at an event).
- The advisory council is a public body; meetings are open to the public and information presented at advisory council meetings is available to the public.
- Anything internal or on pending matter for NOAA as a federal agency, NOAA/ONMS/the sanctuary may be restricted from providing as public information, such as a pre-decisional matter, including at advisory council meetings, although in some situations general information and updates may be provided.
- Marty concluded by reiterating the importance of an advisory council as a group of valuable stakeholders and that, due to their special role and status, each is important for each participant to be aware of process restrictions and guidance regarding communications and conduct..
- She offered to answer any general questions. She noted if people wanted clarity on a specific issue, they could reach out to Lilli who could contact Marty, as needed, for further information.
- This presentation is not being made to all of the advisory councils, as there are various attorneys advising the sanctuaries. Lilli noted she had suggested the information be provided to all in some form (could be in an updated handbook, or by other means).

Native American Engagement Plan Working Group Update (Tom Anderson)

- Bec noted that Morgan Patton could not be at this meeting, but Tom Anderson, a member of the working group looking at making a recommendation on a CBNMS Native American plan of engagement, would give a brief update.
- Tom said, since the last Advisory Council meeting, the working group met in December and again in February. In December, Carol presented to the working group about her experience along the Olympic Coast and recommendations on engagement strategies. The information she provided was enlightening and would be helpful in forming a recommendation moving forward. The working group met again February via conference call with the intention to review some of the information from the December meeting and begin to draft a recommendation for the Advisory Council. Unfortunately, a number of working group participants were not on the call, so the meeting is in the process of being rescheduled for March, with the goal to provide a recommendation for the Advisory Council to consider by the April.
- Bec reviewed the charge of the group, and that a diversity subcommittee would be formed after the working group's work was done. Mike Cummings clarified that the charge was not specific about engaging Native Americans, it was just to look at the idea. Bec re-read the motion that formed the group. She said it has been a challenge for that group to get together.
- Lilli mentioned that it has actually been a subcommittee, since no people from outside the advisory council have been included as group members, so renaming the group to be a subcommittee may be something the group may talk about as part of a recommendation.

Members' and Alternates' Reports (CBNMSAC)

Steve Tubbs – provided an update on to people who had asked him about garbage dumping (had seen the empty dredging scows coming in and thought they were for garbage). He provided those folks with some links about the dredge dumping and has not heard anything since then. He continues to disseminate NOAA information via Facebook and he encouraged people to reach out to him.

- Bec thanked him for reminder that these reports are an opportunity to talk about how members and alternates have shared sanctuary information with their constituencies, and about how these meetings are opportunities to bring back what they are hearing within the community to the advisory council.

Jaime Jahncke – Point Blue Conservation Science (PBCS) did a prioritization exercise on priorities for research and conservation, getting feedback from various folks. They did a spatial assessment to see if priority species and habitats were included in existing state and federal marine protected areas to identify areas where conservation investments would be most beneficial; for some species and habitats, the priorities were similar as what they found years back. PBCS is updating models on where the whales occur within the sanctuaries to evaluate effectiveness of the [voluntary] Vessel Speed Reduction (VSR) program and consider potential ways to improve. They have gotten reviewer feedback and expect publication of two papers within the next couple of months.

Noah Wagner - Crab season has been a bust for the guys out there; there is not a whole lot going on. Everyone has high hopes for the salmon season. There is a salmon information meeting to be held this afternoon at the Sonoma County Water Agency, regarding the expected season and returns from last year. Input is being gathered and the season will be set within a month or so. Dick Ogg is doing a little black cod fishing and there may be a little hagfish fishing going on. The fishing platform at the Spud Point breakwall is open again to public access and the railing was replaced. The Bodega Bay Fisherman's Festival is planned for May 2-3 this year. Benoit Lecomte is trying to bring attention to the Pacific Ocean, the garbage patch, microplastics, etc. He started six months ago from Tokyo to Hawaii, and intended to go to San Francisco, but had to take a break. If interested, look on YouTube for "The Longest Swim."

LCDR Lee Crusius – said he would be going to the salmon season meeting in the afternoon. He recently gave his report on programming in sanctuaries at the Greater Farallones and Monterey Bay national marine sanctuaries' advisory council meetings. Sector Los Angeles-Long Beach has been reporting at the Channel Island National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council meetings. In FY 19, the Coast Guard FY 19 recorded four hours of dedicated flight time in CBNMS. In FY 20 43 hours are planned in the California national marine sanctuaries, and when the Living Marine Resources (LMR) patrols are added, that goes to about 80 hours. In FY 19 there were more hours than just the overflight hours, but the planning and execution was done differently, and sometimes hours were recorded as LMR or something else instead of enforcement. Since the meeting last June with Bill Douros, the planning is more overt. Coast Guard District 11 is leading the way in the Coast Guard on how the programming and reporting out is being done. For Condition Report, for example, the Coast Guard should be able to report out on what kind of LMR work it is doing, not just as LMR. He want to change that so their operators understand what their authority is on missions, and then they can accurately record hours, and at the end of year report on the number of hours for sanctuary enforcement, whale rescues, etc. He also wants to have the Coast Guard break down the reporting by sanctuary.

Dan Glick – NOAA's Office of Law Enforcement (OLE) has been, for a period of time, suffering from loss of personnel and the approval to hire was a long time coming (but it finally happened). There was complete attrition from the Santa Rosa Office. Rad Dew arrived in April and he came in June of 2019. The focus tends to be on more complex, larger investigations, but also there are also day to day interactions, compliance checks, building relationships with the fishing community, etc. A uniformed officer and a supervisory uniformed officer in California may come on by early April. This will give OLE more capacity to look into sanctuary areas of concern. They are encouraging people to give them a heads

up about issues, to leverage by OLE can do. He will also look more into how to bring forward more National Marine Fisheries Service information to these meetings moving forward. The Santa Rosa office area of coverage is from San Francisco Bay all the way to the Oregon border, from 200 miles offshore to coastal wetlands. The Central Valley office person is leaving soon and so the Santa Rosa office will temporarily cover that area too.

Irma Cuevas – said she hosted a youth movie night in January, watching the Cordell Bank National Maine Sanctuary documentary. They were amazed animals come from all over the world to feed in the sanctuary. It was a great opportunity to get them excited about the sanctuary. She also provided some posters. Irma draws from the Santa Rosa area and Tier 1 schools for Youth Exploring Sonoma Coast (YES-Coast). They cover stewardship, career exploration, environmental education, tourism and other topics; they met with the Kashia tribal council and they camp on the coast. They also do recreation: hiking, kayaking, surfing, etc. March 14 in Bodega Bay, she will be out with Noah cleaning up Bodega Bay. A few years ago, she helped install fishing line containers. People can let her know if they know of other opportunities.

Public Comment

- There was none.

Planning for Remaining 2020 Advisory Council Meetings (Bec, Dan, and Dani)

- Bec and Dani talked about the plan being created at Carol's suggestion from the last meeting, and with the advisory council's support. The February items can be checked off. The presentation on the NOAA ocean Noise Reference Station, we are thinking about doing at the August meeting, when the Nancy Foster Scholars will be in town; Samara Haver could then present on that at that meeting. The scholars would like to come to the August meeting. Moving that would leave time open in April. One or more of the other Nancy Foster Scholars (Kate Hewett or Carina Fish) may present then. The diversity subcommittee may start in August, as we do not have any next steps from the Native American Plan of Engagement Working Group yet.

- All of the items in the draft plan for the remaining 2020 CBNMSAC meetings were briefly reviewed.

- Bec noted a lot more ideas were generated at the November retreat than the advisory council has time for in a given year.

-Dani observed she liked the idea of an overall plan. It can also help with planning for things like the Condition Report.

- Lilli mentioned planning for upcoming meetings has always happened among the Chair, Superintendent and advisory council coordinator. She noted there is a need to be flexible, so the work plan does not try to plan out every item for every meeting, and observed things may change moving forward.

- There was a question regarding subunits of the advisory council. Subunit participants are chosen by the chair, and a chair of the subunit is selected from that group. When ready, an advisory council subunit brings its findings back to the full CBNMSAC for consideration. Everyone on the advisory council has a chance at that point to discuss the issues.

- A motion, "To approve the plan with the changes", was moved by Tessa Hill and seconded by Dick Ogg. The motion passed unanimously.

CBNMS Education and Outreach, Conservation Science, and Resource Protection Program Reports (Jennifer, Dani, and Michael Carver)

Education and Outreach: Jenny said she had been back from her detail to the National Park Service for two months, which was a good professional development opportunity, to try on another position, learn, and bring back knowledge to CBNMS. She was acting Chief of Interpretation for Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNS). She worked with three visitor centers and supervised a staff of ten and was the Public Information Officer. There are a lot of visitors coming to PRNS - the opposite of the situation for CBNMS. She oversaw the reopening of the lighthouse, which was closed for over a year and underwent a

renovation costing \$5.6 million. She served on the leadership team and was the lead for the interpretation/education agreement with the Point Reyes National Seashore Association. It was a good learning opportunity. She missed the ocean, ocean sciences, and her education work and is happy to be back with a fresh lens.

- She went over the education mandate in the National Marine Sanctuaries Act and the vision and mission for education in national marine sanctuaries, as well as the documents that guide that effort.

- She is back to doing her radio show.

- Currently, Jenny is serving as the West Coast Region education lead, leading a cross cut team for five national marine sanctuaries on the West Coast, and working to get people on the same page. Some issues are common to all. They are planning to get together in March.

- She stayed engaged in Next Generation Science Standards (NGSS) while on her detail, including a partnership project to connect NGSS to Marin's bay and ocean backyard. It involved four field trips, four after school workshops, and a two day summer institute. This involved 23 teachers and over 3,500 students working with those teachers. She went over the unit themes. The goal was to connect middle and high school teachers to their surroundings. After the grant expired, she assessed how it went, talking with teachers and people in the Marin County Office of Education. That office put in for another NOAA Bay Watershed Education and Training grant on the impact of humans on Marin's coastal ecosystems. CBNMS is a partner in the three year proposal, with Jenny as an advisor helping teachers develop meaningful watershed experiences and to bring in NOAA content. The grant award announcements will be made in the summer.

- On exhibits at PRNS, she is working to get content, a new video and a video screen updated at the Bear Valley Visitor Center. The Point Reyes Lighthouse and Ocean Exploration Center are back open, Monday through Friday.

- The Changing Seas episode featuring Cordell Bank will be shown on March 14th at the San Francisco Ocean Film Festival, and she will have a table with sanctuary information there that day. There is a film about Dick, part of the Every Second Breath Project, that will show before that; it won an award.

- Dick said would they would keep expanding the film series and do other segments, such as on gear recovery.

- Jenny is co-leading a walk at Chimney Rock and the lighthouse with Sarah Allen, Ph.D., in April as part of the Point Reyes Birding and Nature Festival.

- Currently, CBNMS is advertising for a paid intern position for a graduate or undergraduate student to work on digital communication for CBNMS; if people know of anyone or places to advertise the opportunity, they can let her know. She passed around a flyer on the internship.

- To conclude, Jenny circulated a copy of the most recent Earth is Blue magazine; she has a few extra copies she could provide to people if they have a specific audience in mind.

GET Earth is Blue magazine (current as of Feb)

Conservation Science: Dani said she is still doing the CBNMS Research Coordinator role in addition to the acting Superintendent role.

- She passed around a two page document on CBNMS science accomplishments in 2019 and thanked Rachel Pound for helping put it together.

- On the 2017 remotely operated vehicle (ROV) surveys, lots of analysis, interpretation and reporting occurred after the after field work was done. One product from that is on the 2017 ROV cruise to Cordell Bank, which looked at the deeper parts of the bank. Kaitlin Graiff goes through videos taken by the ROV and analyzes them. This work was done as part of the long term science plan to characterize and monitor the CBNMS seafloor across depth zones; work at a shallower depth was done in 2014 compared. New species were recorded. There are difference in the upper and lower bank communities. The lower portion has less cover, but bigger gorgonian corals.

- A report from the cruise done on the *E/V Nautilus* in 2017 is about the first survey of deep habitat in the expanded area of CBNMS. In looking at over 76 hours of video, Kaitlin recorded 11,000 corals, 5,000

sponges and 5,000 fish. There were 31 new observations of corals never seen in CBNMS before, and 11 new sponge species to the sanctuary. People may hear more about a newly discovered species next month.

- They are starting to be able to show a video zonation story of CBNMS communities.
- FY 20 science priorities focus on ecosystem monitoring with some fieldwork; data analysis, interpretation and reporting from Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS), benthic science to be determined; hypoxia monitoring, and recording acoustic data. On the Condition Report, she will do project management, coordination, and working with others on content development.

Resource Protection: Michael Carver said no new permits have been issued since the last advisory council meeting and no applications were pending.

- The administration has proposed changes to the National Environmental Protection Act (NEPA), including shortening the time period for producing NEPA documents and their length, elimination of cumulative effects analysis, and the potential exclusion of some federal actions from NEPA. The Council on Environmental Quality requests public comment. Comments by March 10.
- Scott Artis was interested in receiving the announcement about this, and Lilli said she would provide it to him.
- On shipping industry engagement, Michael noted seeing an increase in cooperation with the national marine sanctuaries' incentive and voluntary VSR efforts; this does not include all of the recent data, which is not in yet. The incentive-based program, with Air District money, changed to giving an incentive for over slowing down over the entire season. He plans to report on actual percent changes at the next meeting.
- A grant from the Marine Mammal Commission had funded Jess Morten for a year; she expanded the letter writing campaign, which included "report cards" and had a number of meetings with industry representatives. The 2019 letters will go out soon. It matters who within the companies does the communicating with their operators, and Michael noted the sanctuaries were still figuring out the right people, to get high level commitments within companies.
- The sanctuaries partnered with the County Air District to quantify, for California, the benefits of air emission reductions associated with the VSR efforts and with researchers to quantify the benefits of noise reduction.
- An enforcement advisory committee meeting is coming up in the spring, to chat about sanctuary regulations and enforcement of those. A significant case is pending; he will share the outcome once resolved.

Members' and Alternates' Reports Cont. (CBNMSAC)

Mike – elections are coming up. He encouraged looking at Marin County Measure D and I.

Tessa – was at the Ocean Sciences meeting last week; Nancy Foster Scholars gave talks on their research. Tessa talked about ACCESS. She, Jaime and Dani were at a separate workshop on monitoring for ocean acidification and hypoxia across Washington, Oregon and California, which included representatives from the governors' offices from those states. They looked at and made recommendations on monitoring across the states in similar ways. Among the recommendations, ACCESS cruises were given priority.

Dick – Fishermen are trying to avoid impacts on whales off Point Reyes. He had an opportunity to do aerial surveys with the California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW) and they saw a significant number of whales off the end of the point, which is also a significant fishing area. The consortium working on crab gear and whale issues decided not to have a season that had a significant amount of entanglement of crab pots with whales. So, even though the season opened, fishermen decided not to go fishing. This helped Half Moon Bay and San Francisco to make the same decisions, so CDFW decided to hold back the season until December 15. There were no entanglements, so it was a good decision. He talked about it being a poor season in general, and that there was a proposal to close the season in April, based on risk; or fishermen may potentially continue with a pot reduction. He thought 80% greater of the

gear had already been pulled from the water. Continuing could help those who need to keep fishing, and the suppliers and retailers. Dick will be testing some “ropeless” gear – where a crab pot has a floatation device on top of it which raises it. While not viable now, it could be an option in the future. He will also work more on lost gear, and wants to have a lost gear recovery day. He would like to utilize side scan sonar device to locate lost gear so it could be recovered. He wants to use various innovations to reduce impacts on whales from entanglement. The salmon season looks good; some salmon have been in the crab pots. The Bodega Bay area is regulated by Klamath River returns; and if that area does not have a good return, it could impact the Bodega Bay area.

Scott – The California Naturalist Program through the University of California just restarted and there are five scholarships for people from West Marin. The program will teach about oceans, watersheds, plants and wildlife. Once certified, naturalists go back to their communities and share the information. Scott arranged to have the ocean information include information about CBNMS. Regarding coho salmon, the 2018-19 season for salmon returning to Lagunitas Creek was the best in 12 years, but the 2019-20 season is the worst in many years, with fewer redds and no salmon seen on the salmon walks. They are doing outreach events, including meetups and beach cleanups; he will keep people posted. Turtle Island Restoration Network is helping with certain information related to the golf course measure on the ballot. - Dani offered if any training was needed for the naturalist program to let her know; Scott said he would follow up on this.

Bec – asked Dick if he missed the previous advisory council meeting due to getting an award. He confirmed that; he got an award from National Fishermen.

Bec adjourned the meeting at 1:51 PM.