



CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL

MEETING MINUTES

February 14, 2019

9:30 AM

Point Reyes National Seashore Association, Conference Room, Point Reyes Station, CA

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the meeting of the Sanctuary Advisory Council for Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS). The council is an advisory body to the sanctuary superintendent. The opinions and findings of this publication do not necessarily reflect the position of CBNMS and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

Call to Order/Roll Call (Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook)

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook, Advisory Council Vice-Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:35 AM and welcomed everyone. Lilli Ferguson, advisory council coordinator, then called roll.

Nongovernmental Members Present:

George Clyde (Community-at-Large - Marin County)
Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large - Marin County)
Tom Anderson (Community-at-Large – Sonoma County)
Steve Tubbs (Community-at-Large – Sonoma County)
Scott Artis (Conservation)
Morgan Patton (Conservation)
Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook (Vice-Chair; Education)
Bec Detrich (Education)
Dick Ogg (Fishing)
Kai Martin (Maritime Activities)
Tessa Hill (Research)

Agency Members and Alternates Present:

CDR Jason Brand (United States Coast Guard [USCG])
Brian Johnson (Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary [GFNMS], alt.)

Members of the CBNMS staff present:

Dan Howard (Sanctuary Superintendent)
Lilli Ferguson (Resource Protection Specialist and advisory council coordinator)
Danielle Lipski (Research Coordinator)
Jennifer Stock (Education and Outreach Coordinator)

Review and Approve Agenda (Leslie)

The advisory council reviewed and unanimously approved the agenda.

Review and Approve November Meeting Minutes (Leslie)

The advisory council reviewed the November 1, 2018 meeting minutes and unanimously approved them.

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report (Dan Howard)

- Dan Howard thanked everyone for being at the meeting in light of the inclement weather.
- He said there was a lot that did not get done during the time frame that federal agencies, including NOAA, were shut down. It was a weird, unsettling time. The staff has been back at work and trying to figure out where they were with work before the shutdown. Another shutdown may be looming, if

Congress does not act by the day after this meeting. Dan mentioned he had vacation time planned for the shutdown, and related some of the ways he spent his time during holidays and the rest of the shutdown period. He said people went through the range of emotions during that time.

- CBNMS does not have a budget for FY 19 [which started October 1, 2018]; the staff will not hear anything until off the continuing resolution approved by Congress. He hoped CBNMS would get enough money for salaries, and some for programs.

- Brian Johnson noted GFNMS had a much larger staff than the CBNMS, including more contractors, and they there was a big all hands meeting upon the return to work. The contract staff did not get back pay; federal staff did (after the fact). At GFNMS, they took up collections for a few people, including for folks on an hourly wage. He reviewed the program implications to GFNMS of the shutdown, which affected conducting Beach Watch surveys, a biosphere reserve meeting, the visitor center, and school and private events.

- Dan noted CBNMS has two contractors, and one had to take on a short term job during the shutdown.

- Tessa Hill added that there are two Nancy Foster Scholars on the University of California payroll, who had not been paid in a long time.

- Leslie noted there had been no trash pickup at Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNS), until Greenhaulers came and volunteers picked it up. A number of interns paid through the Point Reyes National Seashore Association (PRNSA) had to be laid off during the shutdown.

- Dan said some sanctuary sites with scheduled outreach activities with partners had to decide whether to cancel the activities or let the partners run them.

- It is unclear if there were any impacts within CBNMS, such as people illegally fishing.

- Dan added to what he had said at the previous advisory council meeting about the “Rapid” Management Plan review; management plans are supposed to be done every five years at all national marine sanctuaries. It was chaotic, so the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) created a schedule, with rapid management plan reviews and full management plan reviews to be done, alternating every five years for a given sanctuary. Before the holidays, the staff went through an exercise to evaluate the status for activities in the plan, such as have not started, ongoing, completed, or underway. The CBNMS Management Plan is only four years old and was revised as part of the process to expand the sanctuary; the last full review was prior to that. We are now working with ONMS to finalize the results; work on this stopped during the shutdown. He said for the next review, we would work with the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council (CBNMSAC), and set up working groups [as needed] to look at any specific issues critically to see what we have been doing, and what might need to change.

- Lilli noted that when the current review is done, Dan would bring the highlights to the CBNMSAC. She noted some reasons why ONMS had come up with this review schedule. There are only so many staff members at the headquarters available to work with the sanctuaries, and also the intention is to work on getting an updated Condition Report prior to doing a full review.

- Michael Carver, with Dan’s approval, extended his detail to Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary, continuing to act as Deputy Superintendent there. He is enjoying the detail. The plan is for him to return to CBNMS on June 17.

- Someone asked, if there were another shutdown, what is the message to bring to constituents? Dan said advisory council members would have a different message than that of the staff. He thought the message was, the federal government needed to work together to manage everything going on in our country. A concern for the staff, is a shutdown compresses everything, including planning. Also, the staff was not getting funding (or paid) during the furlough. Many federal government employees were told to work with no pay. He had not heard of any “reverse strikes”. Staff who were furloughed were told they could not work, including no checking of emails or work phones. Dan has an interim furlough category, so he could check emails then contact the staff as needed. However, if there had been an emergency, such as an oil leak, it would have been all hands on deck.

- Brian noted there were several tar ball events during the shutdown, and Beach Watch volunteers, who are trained in hazardous materials handling, were not allowed to pick them up off the beaches until after the shutdown. Some beaches they survey are managed by the National Park Service.

- It is unknown from where the oil that created the tar balls originated.
- [Later in the meeting] Dan announced that March 7 – 10 are the dates of the 2019 San Francisco Ocean Film Festival at Fort Mason. He was on film festival board for many years. People may find the schedule online.

Advisory Council Business (Leslie and Lilli)

- Nominations for Chair and Vice-Chair Candidates (for April 2019 election) Leslie stated the next election would be at the April meeting, so nominations for these positions would be taken at this meeting. She is Vice-Chair, with that term ending at the April meeting, and her member term ends in November so she should not be nominated for one of the positions. People can nominate others or themselves; the officer terms are for two years, and a person can serve a maximum of two consecutive terms in the same officer position. She and Lilli briefly explained the duties of each position. The election will be by written ballot; it is good to have more than one candidate for each position. It is not required to serve two consecutive terms as an officer. Alternates may not be nominated or serve.
- There was discussion of holding open the nomination period past this meeting, but Leslie stated it would be best if it could be done at this meeting. She reached out to nongovernmental members not at the meeting to see if they wanted to nominate anyone. After more discussion, Leslie said people who needed more time could about think more about it after this agenda item was over, and decide before the end of the meeting if they wanted to nominate someone or accept a nomination.
- The best candidates would be members who would not be cycling off the advisory council between April 2019 through April 2021; Leslie noted who those members were. Lilli stated she had heard from Don Tanner he would not be able to accept, if nominated.
- Kai Martin nominated himself for both Chair and Vice-Chair; he would be willing to serve in either position, if elected.
- Mike Cummings nominated Tessa for both positions; she said she would think about it [later, she subsequently declined for both positions].
- Leslie noted Jaime Jahncke had suggested Chris Hendry. Since he was not present, Leslie or Lilli will have to find out afterwards if he will accept and will let the group know.
- Bec was nominated for Chair, and accepted the nomination.
- Leslie suggested Morgan Patton as Vice-Chair; she said she wanted to think about it. Lilli said she would let the group know later what she decided.
- Tom Anderson and Steve Tubbs stated they would prefer not to be nominated.
- Tessa said she was happy to nominate Dick Ogg or Noah Wagner (who was not present), if they wanted to accept. Dick declined to be nominated as Chair. George Clyde also nominated Dick as Vice-Chair. Dick accepted the nomination as Vice-Chair. Lilli said she would follow up with Noah to find out if he would accept and would let the group know.

Discussion of Advisory Council's Role of Communication/ Information Exchange with Represented Constituencies (Leslie)

- Leslie recapped that the advisory council had briefly discussed the topic at its last retreat that advisory council members and alternates represent specified constituencies, and provide information they hear at these meetings and from sanctuary staff to people in those constituencies, and also bring forward to these meetings information and thought from people in their represented constituencies. At the retreat, people shared how they were serving that liaison role, and there was a desire to continue that discussion, so this agenda item provides the opportunity to talk about it again, and to hear from the members who joined the advisory council in November.
- Bec talked about how she got involved during the proposed expansion of the sanctuary, and she reviewed the education groups she reaches out to, and said she also reaches out to people just as a citizen of Sonoma County. She mentioned going out on Dick's boat and to Tessa's laboratory.
- Steve noted a lot of people in Sonoma County are unaware of CBNMS. He uses Facebook and other means, such as reaching out to Russian River fly fishers, to reach out to people; so far he has mostly been

providing information about where CBNMS is, and what it is all about. He also notices that a number of people don't understand the interconnections between rivers and oceans/the sanctuary, including the effects of dams on fish.

- Leslie agreed; she deals with teachers and students; some don't know at all about national marine sanctuaries. There are no islands in CBNMS, as there are in GFNMS, and people can't see under the water, so she likes to show underwater photographs of CBNMS. She, Jenny Stock, and the Environmental Action Committee of West Marin reached a lot of kids and adults at a science festival day Leslie organized

- Tom agreed with much of Steve's points about Sonoma County residents. He works at a marina in San Francisco, and so can reach also out to people there. He has talked about the ship strikes of whales issue, and shared the websites with people.

- Brian brings highlights of GFNMS programs to these meetings. He noted the two staffs work closely together. He also brings highlights from these advisory council meetings back to his superintendent.

- Morgan reaches people through the Environmental Action Committee (EAC) of West Marin and its channels. Recently, they hosted Dan at their winter gathering; people enjoyed his presentation about the *Nautilus*. A lot of people do not know about CBNMS, which she bears in mind as she talks to people about it.

- Mike shares with sailing folks, and he races. He also has had the difficulty of people not knowing about CBNMS or national marine sanctuaries. He thought maybe the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation (CMSF) could do a fun fundraiser, such as "give back Tuesdays", as some restaurants in Marin do; he planned to connect with Sarah Hameed about that.

- Scott got a lot of emails and calls where he works, Turtle Island Restoration Network (TIRN), over the recent government shutdown, asking about the conservation impact on CBNMS and sanctuaries nationwide. His organization works with a lot of cosponsors, including companies. They can get social media messages out to larger audience. When people stop into his office, he tells them about their work and also about the connections with sanctuaries.

- Leslie said another role for advisory council members and alternates is to bring information and issues from their represented constituencies back to the advisory council as a body. The liaison role is a "two way street".

- Dick talked about how some fishermen perceived the sanctuary, and about he tries to talk to them. One perception is the sanctuary managers want to take away their opportunities. He lets them know that is not what it is about, and that national marine sanctuaries are trying to protect the environment. He encourages fisherman to understand they themselves are the conservationists, and what can they do to fish sustainably, as well as about not adding debris and removing debris when they find it.

- Mike observed that people tend to lump their perceptions of all the regulations together, and wondered how to get the messages about successes in rebuilding fish stocks to people.

- Dan mentioned he had given a presentation years ago to crab fishermen that was well received, but he agreed with the points made. Maybe he could talk with fishermen annually about CBNMS activities. He reviewed also how sanctuary staff have talked with the Pacific Fishery Management Council (PFMC) about habitat issues from fishing gear, and that that bottom contact fishing gear may not be used on top of Cordell Bank, which came from sharing information with PFMC.

- Kai suggestion the possible use of good infographics for talking to fishermen.

- George stated he also works to get the CBNMS name out there, at every opportunity.

- Lilli mentioned that, though the liaison role was a two way street, there is not the expectation that the advisory council is supposed to be acting as if they were members of the education and outreach staff nor that they have to always agree with sanctuary positions; it is supposed to be about sharing information they have heard through advisory council meetings and emails, including about publications and events. It is also about listening to what people in their represented constituencies have to share about sanctuary matters, and bringing those perspectives back to the advisory council as a body, where Dan hears from the group as a whole. She said she appreciated everyone's efforts.

- Morgan expressed concern about federal offshore oil drilling, and if that could be more of a conflict in the coming months. Dan said there is a sanctuary regulation that prohibits that, and the prohibition is a reason that many people are sanctuary supporters. There is the potential that the President could take some action, but Dan felt there would be pushback, if so. He added that there is also a regulatory prohibition against disturbance of the seabed in CBNMS, so allowing offshore wind development, including a cable back to shore, which disturbed the seabed would be prohibited, unless the regulations were changed via a regulatory process.

CBNMS Education and Outreach, Conservation Science, and Resource Protection Program Reports (Jennifer, Danielle Lipski, and Lilli)

Education and Outreach: Jennifer Stock, CBNMS Education and Outreach Coordinator, talked a bit about the impact of the government shutdown on her work; for example, she had only a week after getting back to work to plan a February workshop. The elephant seals made for a great theme. Teachers are using the next generation science standards in the classroom, and work is going in Marin about how to implement them in the County. Since it is surrounded by water on three sides, that fact is a great focus for climate impacts. The driving question is, "How do we include the study of climate change as it relates to Marin County's coastal and ocean ecosystems in the curriculum and engage students to better understand their local aquatic ecosystems in a way that moves them to stewardship and action?" Field trips are a part of the answer, as well as Science on a Sphere. The field trip in February was to Drake's Beach, where the elephant seals were in large numbers, including in the parking lot. Some topics of discussion were climate impacts, storm impacts, and sea level rise. Science on a sphere is a good for visualizing climate impacts.

- Upcoming is a field trip to China Camp, open ocean wildlife watching, after school workshops, and a two day institute.

- She may apply again for a Bay Watershed Education and Training (BWET) grant.

- Building models is one way to help teach concepts, and she showed a graphic of connections between the land and the sea.

- Jennifer reviewed a project to communicate on Dungeness crabs in a changing ocean, and showed a graphic of that. She wants to talk with fishermen in Bodega Bay about this and the toolkit that was produced on the issue. People are welcome to take copies of the graphic and post them in marinas or elsewhere.

- This is the 30th year of the establishment of CBNMS. She likes to think of significant anniversary years in terms of how to let constituents and the community know about national marine sanctuaries and their impacts. Goals for the anniversary are to recognize what the sanctuary has achieved, build awareness and appreciation, and to celebrate.

Conservation Science: Danielle Lipski, CBNMS Research Coordinator, noted she gave an extensive update in November about what was accomplished in 2018 and what was being planned for 2019. Because of the government shutdown in December and January, and leave she had planned in January, not a lot has happened since the November meeting. She would have normally spent that time frame doing planning and archiving data.

- Some of the impacts on conservation science in CBNMS from the government shutdown were: postponement of servicing the hypoxia moorings; postponement of planning meetings; and the CBNMS research contractor not getting paid during the shutdown period.

- CBNMS is soon going to be welcoming a new contractor, Rachel Pound, a research technician, to the CBNMS conservation science staff. She will be going out and doing field work with Dani. The shutdown delayed Rachel's government clearance, which is still in process. This has to be completed before she can start work; it is hoped she can start in a few weeks.

- It is looking like CBNMS may get time again on Ocean Exploration Trust's E/V *Nautilus*, possibly in early October, as a joint cruise with GFNMS, doing more deep water remotely operated vehicle (ROV) surveys and having perhaps having a telepresence again for outreach and education, including with schools. Dani is going to a planning meeting in March about this cruise.

Resource Protection: Lilli Ferguson, acting CBNMS Resource Protection Program Coordinator, provided an update on the activities that had taken place since November, and also briefly reviewed impacts of the government shutdown on program activities.

- As announced earlier, Michael Carver's detail to Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary, which began in mid-September 2018, has been extended to mid-June 2019. Lilli has continued to act as the program coordinator during this time and is also assigned a subset of Michael's resource protection and deputy Superintendent duties.

- Update on national marine sanctuary permits for CBNMS since November - two permits were issued; two Letters of Authorization were issued under the Superintendent's permit; one application was closed, as a permit was deemed not needed; and two permit applications are under review. She briefly described the purposes for the issued permits and letters.

- As a reminder, a national marine sanctuary permit is required when an individual wishes to conduct an activity within a national marine sanctuary that is otherwise prohibited. Lilli provided the reference in the Code of Federal regulations for CBNMS prohibited or otherwise regulated activities, and the website for where federal regulations may be viewed online.

- On behalf of Special Agent Don Tanner, the NOAA National Marine Fisheries Service advisory council member, who was unable to be at the meeting, Lilli reported that NOAA's Office of Law Enforcement (OLE) has hired one new agent, based in Monterey, and in the near future, would be having another new agent come on, based in Santa Rosa.

- On the reducing lethal ship strikes of whales project, Lilli provided three brief updates.

- 1) On the ongoing voluntary vessel speed reduction (VSR) initiative in the San Francisco Traffic Separation Scheme (SF TSS), in the 2018 VSR time period, for 4,135 relevant vessel transits, 47% of vessels voluntarily slowed to 10 knots or less. Reports will be sent out by a project staff member around March to participating companies. For comparison, in the two previous years, 45% voluntarily slowed. A recognition ceremony is being planned for May. The 2019 voluntary VSR begins May 1.

- 2) On the separate financial incentive for companies to voluntarily vessels in the voluntary VSR effort (a partnership with the Bay Air Quality Management District), 13 shipping companies are to receive financial awards for their 2018 efforts in the SF TSS and/or Santa Barbara Channel. A recognition event is scheduled for March 6 at the Port of Long Beach. The results for 2018 on participating companies' fleets, of the percent distance travelled at 10 knots or less in the voluntary VSR zones are: "Bronze" (10%-25% - 0 companies), "Silver" (25-50% - 4 companies), "Gold" (50-75% - 6 companies) and "Sapphire" (75-100% - 2 companies).

- 3) ONMS is working to streamline data collection, and continues to work with partners to improve outreach efforts on reducing ship strikes of whales. A whale stock assessment is in process. CBNMS is awaiting finalized whale stranding data for our area for 2018.

- To conclude her report, Lilli reminded the group of the upcoming Ocean Climate Summit in San Francisco, about which all advisory council members should have received a notice from the organizers.

Public Comment

- There was none.

CMSF Update (George)

- George provided background about how and when CMSF was established, and about its purpose of supporting CBNMS programs. CMSF can receive federal funds, fundraise to support CBNMS and its programs, and be contracted to do work with federal funds. In the last 2-3 years CMSF raised a little over 10,000 per year, with a few checks yet to come in, and he thanked the advisory council members who contributed. He mentioned a hiccup in getting back to people related to how CMSF mail was received.

- CMSF funds are used for various projects, such as renting a facility for a program or for the hypoxia buoy for research purposes.

- The board is mostly scientists, and does not have experience in outreach and fundraising. They want to expand those capacities and CMSF's technical capability, and involve younger people.
- There was a technical problem with the CMSF email address posted on its website, which bots found, making that email address unusable. They had an email address, which bots found, and now cannot use that email address; problems with email happened through their domain provider.
- George noted CMSF and the staff are joining up to try to do something for the CBNMS 30th anniversary (which is in May, such as an event with an outreach purpose; the event will be later in the year. Dan asked for anyone with venue ideas to let him know.
- Bob Rubin, who teaches at Santa Rosa Junior College, appeared in a marine film series run out of Florida, "Changing Seas". It was about a year about mantas. Through that connection, now CMSF is helping with a film from that organization about CBNMS. A Florida Public Broadcasting Service station will show the film and handle its distribution, once ready; other stations will pick it up. He hoped to get a separate presentation of the film, perhaps during the 30th anniversary event. The film is currently being edited; it is supposed to be completed by spring. The plan is for it to air in spring or early summer.

Regulations for Certain USCG Discharges in Portions of CBNMS and GFNMS, Effective as of 12/10/18 (Dan)

- Dan reviewed that the rule on certain USCG discharges was now final, as of December. He briefly reviewed that this was about a three year process, and involved a series of meetings with the local USCG district. CDR Jason Brand was a part of those discussions. Then the discussions went to DC and there were talks between the two headquarters and General Counsel. The regulatory package came back to the local level for more than one rewrite.
- NOAA settled on granting limited exceptions from the discharge prohibitions in the CBNMS expansion area (and a portion of the GFNMS expansion area) for certain USCG discharges from vessels and aircraft. He reviewed the challenges the USCG had related it would give with complying with the regulatory prohibitions upon the sanctuaries' expansion. If the USCG vessels do not have the capacity to treat vessel sewage or to hold it until outside national marine sanctuary boundaries, they may discharge it in the areas specified in the final rule. The USCG may also discharge items related to training for missions involving search and rescue discharges and ammunition firing and discharges. These were not new activities, but when the sanctuaries expanded, they encompassed the area where the USCG activities were occurring. NOAA worked closely with the USCG on the final rule, and environmental assessment.
- Dan asked if there were any comments or questions.
- Leslie said it was worth noting to new members that the CBNMSAC had recommended that the discharges be allowed by permits. Dan commented the GFNMSAC had a similar recommendation. NOAA did not pursue the permitting option.
- CDR Jason Brand commented he has been here three years, and it was his first priority when reported to Alameda to work with Dan, Lilli and the GFNMS staff on this issue. He said a thorough analysis of the best options was done, and after that went to the USCG and NOAA headquarters, it was out of our hands.
- Dan reviewed the irony of USCG being a federal agency to enforce national marine sanctuary discharge regulations, and hoped that maybe in future USCG could have vessels with [Type I or II] MSDs [by which all vessels may discharge in CBNMS].
- CDR Brand noted the final rule would allow for more USCG presence in the two sanctuary, which could serve as a deterrence.
- There was a brief discussion of some of the issues. The matter was limited only to the specified USCG vessel and aircraft discharge. The analysis indicated the USCG discharges would have only a minimal impact. The USCG needs to be on the water and are there to protect mariners and save lives. Only 13 comments were received during the comment periods. The USCG has 13 missions it must conduct by statute, and many activities under those benefit national marine sanctuaries. The USCG is a good federal partner of CBNMS.

Members' and Alternates' Reports (CBNMSAC)

Leslie – mentioned that during the government shutdown, Drake's beach was closed to protect the elephant seals, so they may pup. The public was allowed to come in the weekend to view them, but kept back at a safe distance. Some good videos were taken and it was a good education opportunity. The Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNSA) bookstores were closed, which financially impacted PRNSA. Some of the science at the Seashore, including monitoring Coho Salmon, had to be put on the back burner; data was lost as the scientists were not able to monitor until January 28. They are now also monitoring for steelhead. There are new "Get to the Point" family-style educational outings in the Seashore, including one on whales at Chimney Rock. They saw no whales but did see elephant seals. Future opportunities will be announced on the PRNSA website and through other venues.

CDR Brand – regarding the PFMC, he goes to those for the USCG, and can an advocate for the national marine sanctuaries there. The day after this meeting, he will be at the Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting. The government shutdown affected the USCG also, but they wanted to keep the crab vessel fleet safe. Most of the USCG active duty employees worked, but most of the USCG civilian employees were furloughed. If there is another government shutdown, of their missions, number one is search and rescue.

Scott – said TIRN took adults, kids, and families to see the salmon and to explain salmon ecology and how they are tied to ocean, as well as why TIRN is involved. It was a record year, and TIRN is working with the data to see what they can get out of it, and will disseminate some of it later. Some of the data is gathered from creeks on private property, with permission. Recently, they had some community members out to view the restoration site. Any members of the advisory council that want to tour it can let him know. It is great to see the changes and the use by the salmon. TIRN is also doing plastics ocean work; there is a big push locally and across the country.

Scott (for Morgan, who had to leave the meeting early) – As mentioned previously, Dan gave a presentation to EAC. EAC continues to work on coastal resource protection through watchdog work. The Marin County Coastal Program Amendment was finally certified. Hog Island Oyster Company got approvals for development permits from the California Coastal Commission. EAC was concerned with after-the-fact permitting in areas of mapped eelgrass. Tickets on sale for the EAC birding festival in the spring. EAC is a collaborator on marine protected areas collaborative online training.

George – He arranged for Dan to speak at a meeting of the Berkeley City Club, with an audience of about 150 people from the Berkeley business community. Forty years ago, a group of amateur divers took photos of Cordell Bank, with probably caused the sanctuary to be formed. The annual reunion of those divers is coming up in a month. The GFNMS Advisory Council has a new working group, which he is a part of, on restoration of native oysters in Tomales Bay; its first meeting is in March.

Dick – on the crab industry, he said there was a domoic acid issue in the beginning of the year. It was clear from Point Reyes to Bodega Head; above Bodega Head to Salt Point still had domoic acid issues. He does some of the domoic acid testing. Often, the domoic acid is seen where the rivers come in; he speculates the agricultural could have an impact on the algae. There was also some impact in the Manchester Beach and Fort Bragg areas. The crab fishery is relatively slow this year; there are a tremendous amount of short crabs, so next year may be outstanding. They may receive about the same salmon season as last year, which was short. That was detrimental to fishermen. He is seeing warm water out there, along the shorelines. Dan asked about a protocol to shut down the crab fishery if whale entanglement occurs. Dick said there us a program that looks at forage, whale concentration and gear concentration. He is meeting with the Dung Crab Fishing Gear Working Group the Monday following this meeting. He said a problem was that the correlation of gear and whale concentrations does not necessarily mean whale entanglement will take place. Whales' feeding habits have the most impact on

them getting tangled in crab gear, so it is important to focus on where anchovies and herring are concentrated. There is currently a lawsuit on this topic as well, and the judge wants action. Fishermen are applying for a marine mammal take permit, but others are saying that would take too long and they want action now. The group of humpbacks in this area are endangered. Because the California Department of Fish and Wildlife did not get a take permit, and allowed the fishermen to continue to fish, that is why the Center for Biological Diversity launched the lawsuit. One option would to end the season early, in May, which would take the gear out of the water. However, that would financially impact the fishermen.

Bec – Westminster Woods, her organization, is still piloting Winged Ambassadors. Kids get excited; they learn about the wingspan, salt glands in the birds' web feet, etc. The spring conference of the Association for Environmentalists and Outdoor Educators, and some classroom teachers, will be the third week of March at Westminster Woods. There will be some presenters on ocean topics, and Westminster Woods staff members are leading an outing to the ocean. They have salmon and smolt in Dutch Mill Creek.

Tessa –there is a new infographic from the Ocean Science Trust and Ocean Protection Council on ocean acidification California living marine resources. She sent it to Lilli, so Lilli can send it out to this group. It talks about what we know, as well as knowledge gaps. She has heard that “ropeless” crab gear is being testing. Lilli said that alternative crab gear is being testing in several national marine sanctuaries under a permit; she said it is not entirely ropeless – the line and buoy are attached to the crab pot and are acoustically released – so it is just that the line is not in the water column as line as for a traditional crab pot. Tessa mentioned an interesting exhibit at the California Academy of Sciences, which integrates the fishing industry and other human activities; it will be there for about two years. There is also a foggy redwood room. The scientists would be interested in feedback on the science of those things in the exhibit.

Steve – has been trying to get the word out to people about his involvement with the sanctuary advisory council, and he gets messages out on a fly fishing web page and has posted about the salmon in Dutch Mill Creek. He is happy to share anything anyone has that would be beneficial to get out there.

Brian – the next Ocean Climate Summit will be at the General's Residence on April 18 in San Francisco, and all advisory council members are invited. The agenda is still being finalized and they are still working on a keynote speaker, but will include the state of the science and breakout groups related to ocean climate. It will be a full day. More information will be coming out. They do these every couple of years.

After the members' and alternates' reports concluded, Tessa said she had a question, which she had raised with Lilli and Dan, and had discussed with Dan, about adding a discussion item to a future meeting agenda, of having a seat for a tribal or indigenous community member. Some other advisory councils have them; at Channel Islands, it is a community seat, she stated. Lilli said only a few advisory councils of the fourteen across the system have tribal seats; at Olympic Coast National Marine Sanctuary, there are three federally-recognized tribes along the coast, which have tribal treaty fishing rights. She and Dan agreed we could talk about having this on a future agenda. Dan added that, during the expansion of CBNMS and GFNMS, outreach was done to the local federally recognized tribes; he felt they are cautious to engage. Some discussion has occurred around [GFNMS] shoreline usage. He said this topic could be discussed at a future meeting, to talk about all the pros and cons, describe the seats or other involvement at other sanctuaries, etc.

Leslie adjourned the meeting at 2:00 PM.