



# CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY

## Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Minutes

---

December 3, 2009

Point Reyes National Seashore Red Barn Classroom

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

### **Welcome**

Advisory Council Vice-Chair, George Clyde, called the meeting to order at 9:35am

### **Roll Call**

#### Members present:

George Clyde (Council Vice-Chair and Community-at-Large Marin)  
Todd Steiner (Conservation Alt.)  
Jaime Jahncke (Research Alt.)  
Ed Smith (Research)  
Bill McMillon (Education Alt.)  
Brian Johnson (GFNMS deputy superintendent)  
Paul Michel (MBNMS superintendent)  
Dan Howard (CBNMS superintendent)  
LT Brittany Steward (US Coast Guard – living marine resources officer)

#### Other meeting participants:

Michael Carver (CBNMS resource protection and operations coordinator)  
Kaitlin Graiff (CBNMS SAC coordinator/research specialist)  
Brendon Sulfridge (US Coast Guard - oil spill response)  
Eric Juback (US Coast Guard – oil spill response)

### **Review Agenda**

The agenda was unanimously approved with no changes

### **Review of September Minutes (George Clyde)**

The September 24, 2009 meeting minutes were approved with the minor changes put forward by LT Brittany Steward

George motions to adopt September minutes as final, Ed approves, Todd Seconds, all in favor  
*September minutes accepted as final*

### **Public Comment**

- i. Brendon Sulfridge (US Coast Guard): gave overview of United State Coast Guard (USCG) pollution response; oil spill relief is supported by a billion dollar trust fund to provide funding for contractors to aid in response.
- ii. Jackie Dragon (Pacific Environment): listed some sanctuary resource protection issues such as ocean noise, shipping, oil spills (recent Dubai Star) and whale ship strikes.
  - Conversation regarding vessel refueling practices: booming is the only precautionary tool to prevent fuel from spilling and reaching beaches. Pacific Environment drafted a letter to Governor Schwarzenegger regarding the use of oil booms in the state. Jackie stresses that improvements can be made from the Costco Busan oil spill.

- Pacific Environment is also suggesting that vessels slow their speeds to reduce pollution emissions – often the shipping industry is slowing down because it is more cost efficient and saves whales.
  - Policy statement regarding ocean noise is available on the National Marine Sanctuaries website.
- iii. Group discussion of oil spill response: about 900 vessels/yr transfer fuel while in San Francisco Bay; 30 minutes is the minimum requirement for boom response to spill; the first priority is to secure the source and it is often difficult to respond in 30 minutes; vessels transferring fuel are pre-boomed in Washington state; transfer vessel is responsible for carrying boom; boom is no longer effective at certain current direction and speeds; Dubai Star spill was a heavy grade fuel oil; are California ports more busy than Washington ports? – Puget Sound has more collisions due to complexities for navigating.

#### **Manager's Report (Dan Howard)**

- i. Budget: FY10 budget hopefully available in January. The continuing resolution ends on Dec 18<sup>th</sup>.
- ii. Cordell Bank Office Expansion: Breaking ground in August 2010, staff will be relocated for six months until January/February 2011. No current arrangement for relocation site, considering PRBO in Petaluma; Brian Johnson suggested Gulf of Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS) office space and securing the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS) server at the GFNMS office.
- iii. Community support of CBNMS and GFNMS boundary expansion: Sonoma county consortium of non-profits (including Coast Walk, Russian Riverkeeper); meeting at Bodega Marine Laboratory, December 7<sup>th</sup> 4-6pm.
  - CBNMS Sanctuary Advisory Council (SAC) previously passed a resolution to expand the original proposed CBNMS boundary to include Bodega Canyon, these boundary modifications were adopted into the bill. NOAAs decision on supporting the expansion bill is dependent on budget and reauthorization of the Sanctuaries Act
- iv. SAC Summit: May 11<sup>th</sup>-13<sup>th</sup>, any ideas for providing a case study and agenda items (i.e. policy issues).
  - Brittany suggested the issue of ship-strikes as it could be a national effort with the USCG.
  - At last year's Summit, George proposed to Dan Basta the idea of creating a "SAC of SACs" – to cross pollinate the different sites and solicit council members from other sites for their individual expertise.
- v. Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation: meeting with the national foundation board members in Monterey and meeting the national foundation's new executive director Jason Patlis. Jason has invited executive leaders from all sanctuary foundations/friends groups to meet and discuss how they can work together.
- vi. Holiday open house: SAC members invited to holiday party hosted by the Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNS), State Parks and CBNMS, Dec. 11<sup>th</sup> 5:30-7:30pm at the PRNS visitors center.

#### **Education update:**

- vii. CBNMS website renovation: to match the national marine sanctuary template
- viii. ACES Grant: Jenny submitted a Whale Tail Grant (CA Coastal Commission-license plate funds) with Oikonos Ecosystem Knowledge and US Satellite Lab, collaborators on the ACES program (Animals in Curriculum Based Ecosystem Studies)
- ix. Teacher at Sea: recruiting teachers through the NOAA teacher at sea program to recruit teachers for 2010 research cruises.
- x. Oral History project: applied for more funds to support the oral history work with Cordell Expedition Divers
- xi. Winter Special Events: a week to promote winter wildlife in the Point Reyes area and encourage people to visit the area and support local businesses
  - January 20<sup>th</sup> CBNMS is hosting an evening lecture focused on marine technology used in the sanctuary, PRNS Red Barn Classroom.

## Resource Protection Report (Michael Carver, LT Brittany Steward)

Michael Carver's report:

- i. Marine debris removal work using the ROV within Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS); showed a quick news video of cruise.
- ii. Twin Otter aircraft: map of aerial transects conducted with the plane; 150 hrs is shared among the west coast sanctuaries; flew transects with enforcement officer, Derek Roy (NOAA special agent who can enforce sanctuary and marine life protection act (MLPA) regulations); covered GFNMS and CBNMS in a few hours; twin otter has a large bubble window to view from; Michael took written observations and photos of vessels in the sanctuary; flight height at 1000 feet over CBNMS and 2000 ft over seabird colonies; in addition to the Twin Otter, data are also collected by the regional pelagic and Cordell Bank ocean monitoring cruises on the R/V Fulmar, USCG Automatic identification system (AIS) data, USCG air support, USCG vessel support.
- iii. Memorandum of agreement (MOA): being developed to solidify sanctuary relationship with USCG

LT Brittany Steward's USCG report:

- iv. Crab season is open: USCG did vessel safety checks at the docks and boarded 25 vessels at sea - found no fishing violations, 3 safety violations and 1 boat was terminated due to an old lifeboat; enforcement for crab season is currently the USCG top priority.
- v. Air Station Sacramento: transported seabirds affected by algal bloom in Washington to the seabird protection office.

## Research Report (Lisa Etherington)

- i. Reef Crest Surveys: will be dedicated to exploring and monitoring the upper reef crest of Cordell Bank, hopefully using the expertise of technical divers from the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries. The main goals of the project are to establish long-term monitoring of the benthic community on the upper pinnacles, revisit the sites that were originally explored by Cordell Expeditions in the 70's and 80's and collect specimens (such as sponges, tunicates and corals) for identification; underwater video and still imagery will be used for habitat assessment and education.
- ii. Deep-sea coral exploration: using NOAA ship McArthur II for summer 2010; using a remotely operated vehicle (ROV) to study deep sea coral in areas in CBNMS and sites within the potential expansion area (including Bodega Canyon)
- iii. Regional Ocean Monitoring: collaborative project with PRBO conservation science and GFNMS will continue investigating the spatial and temporal relationships between oceanographic processes, zooplankton, and marine birds and mammals in the region surrounding CBNMS and GFNMS. The monitoring is expanding into northern half of MBNMS and also includes near shore areas including some state marine protected areas (MPAs)
- iv. Archiving historic Cordell Expedition photographs with California Academy of Sciences (CAS)
- v. Databases being developed to manage and archive research and monitoring data collected by sanctuary staff and partner agencies – including a species and photo database and cruise register.

## Break

## Revisions to Council Charter

- i. Developing council work plan: GFNMS work plan organized by management plan items. Discussion on how to gain public input for work plan: have three meetings – 1<sup>st</sup> public meeting to draft ideas with the public input, 2<sup>nd</sup> council retreat to further work plan discussion and 3<sup>rd</sup> public meeting develop final work plan with public input. Suggested added language to charter on page 3 bullet 6: *“Compile a list of topics and issues to be prioritized by superintendent and the council chair and coordinator”*

- ii. Youth member discussion: Strict regulations and rules for youth members. Removing youth group language from charter (page 4). Proposed idea to create a youth group outside of the charter and incorporate into Vic's education group. Bill McMillon offered to coordinate.
- iii. Additional member seats: Addition of fishing representative (pg 6) in order to broaden maritime activities seat. Discussion about local government officials serving as voting SAC members – no nexus with counties and Cordell Bank being an offshore site in federal waters
- iv. Working groups and subcommittees (pg 12) meetings are not subject to public meeting requirements – but will be publically advertised time permitting.

**Action:**

George motions for primary seats to accept the revisions to the Cordell Bank Sanctuary Advisory Council charter as final, Bill approves, Ed seconds, all in favor  
*Council Charter revisions accepted unanimously*

**Formation of Council Executive Committee (George Clyde)**

- i. Executive committee will consist of primary council members who will be able to serve on an expedited basis via phone or person to develop recommendations to the council.
- ii. Draft of executive committee document will be circulated at next meeting.

**Action:**

George motions for primary seats to establish the Executive Committee and he will present document at the next council meeting; Bill approves; Ed seconds; all in favor  
*Formation of a Council Executive Committee accepted unanimously*

**Lunch**

**Presentation: MBNMS MPA Planning Process Update (Paul Michel)**

- i. Core values of MBNMS → a healthy Sanctuary ecosystem supports sustainable uses, economies and coastal communities
- ii. MBNMS MPA Goals: Protect unique and rare places; Protect areas where natural ecosystem components are maintained and/or restored; Establish research areas to monitor anthropogenic versus ecological processes
- iii. Time line of key steps – 2001: MPAs were the number one issue brought up by the public during the Joint Management Review Process; 2002-2007: MPA SAC working group; Fed 2008: announcement for the need of MPAs in federal waters of MBNMS; April 2008: MBNMS provide more rationale for decision
- iv. MBNMS MPA Action Plan (key strategies): 1) Develop partnerships with interagency partners for common goals 2) coordinate MPA development with other management measures 3) Develop interagency coordination mechanisms 4) Consider the variety of extractive and non-extractive uses within MPAs
- v. Pacific Fisheries Management Council (PFMC) provided feedback in July 2008 for moving forward with MPA planning process. Also gained advice from other partner agencies. In addition there are other complementary management programs to the MPA planning process. Therefore this process is a comprehensive approach that considers multiple management objectives with partner agencies → Integrated Ecosystem-Based Management
- vi. Approaches for Ecosystem-Based Management - Integrated Ecosystem Assessment (IEA); West Coast IEA and MBNMS goals will be imbedded in the MPA process
- vii. The MBNMS MPA process is overall an ecosystem goal project.
- viii. The MBNMS Ecosystem Goal Project involves three major components 1) analytical input (informs) 2) stakeholder input (advises) 3) implementation pathways (implements) to achieve a “resilient, healthy ecosystem in support of sustainable economies and communities.”
- ix. MBNMS is committed to working with SAC, National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) and PFMC to ensure an effective and timely public process.

Discussion: Effectiveness of MPAs will be monitored through research; Going through the IEA process will let MBNMS evaluate the goals of MBNMS

### **Ship Strike Report (Dan Howard)**

Summary of recent ship strike events in northern California:

- i. On October 19, a vessel mapping the ocean floor struck a blue whale about 1.3 miles off the coast of California. A few hours later, the 70-foot female whale washed ashore near Fort Bragg, about seven miles down the coast. Vessel was traveling about 5.5 knots (about 6 miles per hour). The hydrographic survey vessel was mapping the ocean floor off the California coast, under a contract managed by NOAA's Office of Coast Survey. The whale surfaced under the vessel's propeller.
- ii. On October 9, a blue whale mortality occurred off Cambria. This was a juvenile male, 53-feet long, found floating in kelp bed approximately 700 meters offshore. The necropsy showed external bruising and fractured vertebrae, death was determined to be a ship strike.
- iii. On November 23, a sperm whale washed ashore at South Beach at Point Reyes National Seashore. The whale was a 30-foot young female and death is tentatively attributed to a ship strike because of large amount of blood and bruising in the cranium area and broken bone.
- iv. Reducing ship strikes on large cetaceans: Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (CINMS) document outlined ship strike case studies from other regions and developed recommendations for the CINMS SAC to address ship strike threats in the Santa Barbara Channel. Report developed 7 areas of recommendations. Report can be found on the CINMS website: <http://channelislands.noaa.gov/focus/alert.html>
- v. Whale abundance and distribution in CBNMS and GFNMS for 2009:
  - Three survey months: humpback abundance was much greater in September than in May and June. Blue whales observed in September were east of the Farallon Islands rather than over the shelf break. Summary: there is extreme variability in whale distribution spatially and temporally.
  - Dan suggested that members look over the CINMS document, focus on the case studies and determine how to incorporate recommendations – i.e.: how to alert people/vessels when there are a lot of whale in the area.
  - CINMS notice to mariners occurs from Sept – Oct when 3 whales are observed in the fishing lanes, then when presence of whales increases the recommendation to vessels is to decrease speed to 10kts.

### **Members Reports**

- i. George Clyde: played his West Marin KWMR report on the CBNMS field seminar
- ii. Paul Michel: Blue Ocean Film Festival is coming to Monterey in 2010; Planning on breaking ground for the sanctuary education center in Santa Cruz next summer; Joint GFNMS and MBNMS SAC meeting in February
- iii. Ed Smith: studying potential impacts of dredging on herring and also doing oil spill response
- iv. Bill McMillon: Vic's education program is in full swing and kids are setting up research projects for marine debris removal
- v. LT Brittany Steward: developing memorandums of agreement (MOAs) with three northern sanctuaries and USCG to document the relationship and collaboration of sanctuaries and USCG
- vi. Brian Johnson: GFNMS facilities renovation work begins next year; Climate Change Site Scenario document out for peer review next month; Next GFNMS SAC meeting (Thursday Dec 10<sup>th</sup>) talking about the white shark permitting.
- vii. Jaime Jahncke: California Current hotspots presentation at next SAC meeting (describing hotspots in MBNMS, CBNMS and GFNMS)
- viii. Todd Steiner: Olive ridley turtle washed up on Stinson beach, not very many Salmon coming up the Lagunitas creek.

## **Council Business**

### 2010 council meeting dates:

- Feb 4<sup>th</sup>, April 8<sup>th</sup>, July 15<sup>th</sup> Sept 30<sup>th</sup> (retreat), Nov 18<sup>th</sup>

### Council 2010 work plan ideas:

- Notification plan vessels for whales strikes (could work jointly with GFNMS SAC)
- Developing action items for the climate change site scenario
- Development of high school education involvement (Bill will work on this outside the SAC)
- Brittany is interested in user groups of CBNMS and summarizing that information for the public
- Jackie is interested in a noise impact working group (Dan suggested she contact Lance on how to move forward, could jointly work with GFNMS SAC).
- Walk though the joint management plan: priorities of management and review the document with members

Meeting adjourned at 3:30pm