

**Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary  
Advisory Council Meeting  
September 10, 2002  
MEETING MINUTES**

Meeting was called to order at 0937.

The meeting began with an Introduction of NOAA staff Allen Tom and Brady Phillips. Then Roll Call was conducted.

**COUNCIL MEMBERS & ALTERNATES PRESENT**

Josh Churchman, Alternate/Maritime Activity  
Dan Cohen, Alternate/Research  
Carol Keiper, Member/Research & Council Chair  
Tom Lambert, Member/Conservation  
Bill McMillon, Alternate/Education  
Doreen Moser, Member/Education  
Rick Powers, Member/Maritime Activity  
Joe Smith, Member/Community at Large

**ABSENT**

Brian Mulvey, Member/Government  
Kathy Soave, Alternate/Education

**STAFF**

Dan Howard, Assistant Sanctuary Manager  
Mary Jane Schramm, Council Coordinator  
Ed Ueber, Sanctuary Manager

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Cordell Bank new phone number: 415/ 663-0314  
Extensions: Dan Howard, ext. 102  
Michael Carver, ext. 101  
Jennifer Stock, ext. 104  
Dale Roberts, ext. 103

Carol Keiper presented a report on discussions with research constituents. She met with Dan Cohen, Sarah Allen, David Ainley and others. All recommended the following: characterize ecosystem; map habitats; map currents; perform a full inventory of species. Only then can monitoring be effective.

Researchers recommended the Sanctuary build collaborations and interdisciplinary coalitions and partnerships. Ecosystem trophic level sampling is needed.

Josh Churchman was concerned with white shark population and asked, is a population explosion imminent? This could have repercussions to pinnipeds. "If there are only 250 white sharks in the population worldwide, it's hard to believe we see 10 % of them."

Doreen Moser reported on a live-linked remotely operated vehicle (ROV) run by the Mystic Aquarium and funded by Bob Ballard out of Monterey Bay. This ROV brings areas of ocean remote site to students to study the underwater life. The technology is already in place and CBNMS should take advantage of this technology in our outreach efforts.

Last week Rick Powers had a pelagic bird cruise with Rich Stallcup on which an impressive number of species was seen: tens of thousands of storm petrels, high numbers of auklets, jaegers, skuas, lots of krill, lots of feeding activity. Carol Keiper passed along the species list from the trip. Ed Ueber announced that a pelagic trip for Council members would occur Tuesday, October 22. Tom Lambert also mentioned the late September FMSA trip.

Rick Powers reported he saw no fishing on the Bank, just on the slope. Some birders are concerned that Black-footed Albatross might disappear.

Joe Smith will meet with Redwood Highway Chamber of Commerce to make acquaintances in the event we want to form alliances re: boundary expansion issue and other projects.

#### **APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES:**

Last meeting's minutes were seconded and approved as written.

#### **FISHING TECHNIQUES PRESENTATION: JOSH CHURCHMAN**

Josh Churchman gave a presentation on fishing techniques. He defined trawling as dragging a net, trolling as dragging a line with hooks. Trawls can be bottom, or midwater. Midwater is less destructive to habitat.

Nearshore, shelf and slope are three distinct habitats. Cordell Bank is comprised of slope and shelf. Bocaccio and chilipepper are split among different depths from between 300 and 900 feet.

Hook and line vertical is the traditional method. Longlining with a buoy is another.

The first people to fish Cordell in the late 1800's used hook and line. By 1940's & 50's trawling was more widely used elsewhere but not at Cordell. Areas with pinnacles were avoided to prevent damage to gear. Set long lining became popular in the 1980's.

Josh Churchman believed that hake harvesting in the 1970's carved a 12-mile swath up and down the coast. Koreans fishermen were involved. Roller gear became popular, and accessed areas where chain gear could not go. Boats became more powerful. Midwater trawls with sonar could intercept large schools of fish. The peak tonnage, landed in 1977, was about 2,000 tons.

Churchman further believed that during the 1980's the gillnet fishery began, though illegal on Cordell Bank. This technique effectively removed the last "hiding place" for fish. Ghost nets may still fish the Bank. The majority of fish on Cordell Bank were taken by gillnet. A huge increase in party boats has occurred, each with the ability to catch 3,000 lbs. a day.

The 1990's saw a steady decline in stocks. Trolling replaced gillnets, which is a much cleaner fishery, which caught 10,000 lbs. of fish per day. Josh Churchman indicated we're now "broom and dustpanning" to catch the remnants of fish stocks.

The year 2001 saw the removal of the hook and line fishery. In 2002 fishing for all species was banned at depths from between 120 feet and 900-feet around the Bank.

Rick Powers reported that occasionally trawl boats constitute the remaining fleet above the Bank, and they are flatfishing.

Ed Ueber stated that there is a new proposed annual quota between 6-9 tons, down from 100 tons last time. This year's ban is likely to remain in effect for the next few years.

John Churchman stated that the Pacific Fisheries Management Council (PFMC) has created a "discard fishery." A "discard fishery" mentality suits bean counters, not fishermen. As an example, fishermen take considerable chilipepper to get their quotas of bocaccio.

The crab fishery is now only in 60 ft. depths in the Canyon area. No real testing is being done on whether females are gravid, and can withstand repeated hauling. Josh Churchman wants to examine what a sustainable fishery looks like. Hook and line is the only viable industry for Cordell Bank.

Ed Ueber indicated that a box crab fishery was being considered at one time in addition to Dungeness crab.

Salmon is exclusively a troll fishery.

Sanctuaries have no jurisdiction over fisheries; fishermen can talk to PCFMC or to the Department of Fish & Game about fishery regulations. Experimental fisheries would need Sanctuary permits.

Dan Howard's surveys may identify practices that are destructive to habitat.

Daniel Cohen cited a Scripps Institute study that indicated a 20% decrease in zooplankton has occurred. Any Sea Surface Temperature (SST) increase may have further impacts.

When the sardine industry collapsed, overfishing was blamed for the crash. Other factors now have been identified as contributors.

Spawning anchovy and sardine inhabit the upper layers of the sea. High wind drove larvae down in the water column. Sardine and anchovy feed in different ways.

Josh Churchman said that widow rockfish were cited as example of fisheries on spawning fish, removing the next generation of fish.

Dan Cohen proposed making models of fisheries for various species, in order to isolate which elements could be controlled.

Josh Churchman recommended we look at spawning patterns and variables among different species, and offered that fishermen can be valuable contributors to research.

If the Dungeness crab fishery doesn't crash soon it will be a miracle, but that's where the pressure is shifting. There are some limits on California crabbers. Approaches include shutting down fisheries and transfer of fishing effort shifting to nearshore. Josh Churchman is refusing to use his existing nearshore permits to fish in the Lagoon.

Recommendations were made for advertising future meetings – Supplement regular issuance of press releases with targeted contacts with the Bodega Bay Navigator, Pt. Reyes Light and other local publications. Individual Council members can also send flyers to libraries and meetings should be posted on websites. Cordell Bank NMS has a website:

**JOINT MANAGEMENT PLAN REVIEW (JMPR):**

The meeting resumed at 1050 a.m. Anne Walton reviewed the priority of issues in the JMPR:

The Monterey Bay NMS Council met in August and made recommendations on cross-cutting and site-specific issues. Anne is seeking participants for the working groups.

The three sanctuaries cover nearly 400 miles of coast

Management plans have two parts:

1. Non-regulatory parts – education, outreach, research, monitoring
2. Regulatory component – prohibitions, permits and boundary issues.

At the April 15<sup>th</sup> meeting in Half Moon Bay the group covered cross-cutting and site-specific issues for Cordell Bank and synthesized the issues in the July 8<sup>th</sup> report. This represents the basis of today's discussion.

The criteria for these ratings were:

1. Site benefits;
2. Short term feasibility;
3. Long-term feasibility.

Cross cutting issues include coordinated management, fisheries resources and activities, emergency response, cultural resources, ecosystem monitoring, community outreach, and education for Gulf of the Farallones and Cordell Bank.

Today the objective is to finalize input on issue selection, then draft work plans for action plan development; the objective is to present a draft work plan to the Council in October.

Working groups will meet between October 2002 and April 2003 and will expand on issues not currently fully addressed. They can be long-standing working groups or ad hoc groups. Staff team can assist with administrative issues.

**REVIEW OF PROGRESS TO DATE:**

Spring 2001: reviewed current Plan.

November 2001 the State of the Sanctuary Report was issued;

Winter 2001/2002: scoping meetings were held

Today: form working groups

Next: release draft MP in one to two years from now.

Summer 2004: final Management Plan to be released.

## REVIEW OF TABLE 4.1 – SUMMARY OF PROPOSED ISSUES.

### **ADMINISTRATION/COORDINATED MANAGEMENT:**

Assistant managers are to be involved in coordinated management. Doreen Moser noted that Cordell Bank & Gulf of the Farallones already coordinate, but need to do so with Monterey Bay.

There are various reasons for examining the boundary question; should Cordell Bank think ahead to the time when Cordell is a stand-alone sanctuary? Ed Ueber recommended the Council focus on current status of the two sanctuaries.

Josh Churchman proposed to include issues in cross-cutting to develop separate infrastructure, the other as Brady Phillips explained might be agency streamlining. Joe Smith suggested that we leave the management status quo in place.

**MOTION:** Cordell Bank SAC agrees Cordell Bank staff should be a separate staff.

**VOTE:** six in favor, one abstaining. None opposed.

Bill McMillon clarified that development of separate staff is cross-cutting.

### **FISHING ACTIVITIES:**

Joe Smith commented that Monterey Bay should not separate out fishing issues. Sean Morton clarified that Monterey Bay has already been working with fishing groups, etc. They did not view this as a fishing issue, but as an ecosystem issue.

Monterey Bay recognizes a need for consistent direction, and marine reserve creation, and did not want to see the issue muddled between April and July. Anne Walton clarified that there will be a cross-cutting team as well as individual working groups.

It was recommended that the fishery impacts be placed in every category. The Council recommends that they be put on a list for site-specific level fishery activities.

Anne Walton stated that if Cordell Bank wants to make a motion for separate fishing activity, they can do so. If there is no objection to the present language, no motion need be made.

Sean Morton clarified there can be uniformity and still separately addressed issues at each site. Monterey Bay deals with fishery issues locally, they can put forward a recommendation. Anne Walton suggested we develop an overall 3-site policy, then look at site-by-site items.

Sean Morton noted "the Promise" that the Monterey Bay NMS Sanctuary would not be involved in fisheries issues. The "Promise" was made back in 1992 and involves Monterey Bay but not the Gulf of the Farallones or Cordell Bank Sanctuaries.

Ed Ueber said that if the Cordell Bank Sanctuary feels it wants to work jointly with Gulf of the Farallones and Monterey Bay, it can do so.

Carol Keiper noted the need for a motion to accept those proposed points.

Rick Powers wants Sanctuaries to have more input with PFMC. Also, they should implement monitoring that is directly related to fisheries issues. Fish landings cannot be sole indicator.

Krill harvesting is currently prohibited in state waters but the issue is under review. Interest can arise again. The recommendation was made that it be handled as cross-cutting issue for Gulf of the Farallones & Cordell Bank.

Dan Howard said to ignore the Monterey Bay "blue" language. Cordell Bank will address that independently.

Ed Ueber asked, how can this Sanctuary coordinate with Monterey Bay when they haven't expressed willingness to work with Cordell Bank and Gulf of the Farallones on fisheries issues?

**MOTION:** Include monitoring directly related to proper monitoring of fisheries activities.

**VOTE:** passed unanimously

**MOTION:** Sanctuary should closely coordinate with Pacific Fisheries Management Council re: fishery related issues within Sanctuary areas.

**VOTE:** unanimously passed, no abstaining votes.

Sean Morton stated that Monterey Bay is open to cross-discussion of issues like krill harvesting.

**EMERGENCY RESPONSE:**

**MOTION:** to honor staff recommendation to defer this issue.

VOTE: Unanimous vote aye.

**CULTURAL RESOURCES:**

There are no known wrecks exist on Cordell Bank within the existing boundaries. An historic resource must be 50 years and older.

Cultural resources should be crosscutting between Gulf of the Farallones and Monterey, but not Cordell Bank.

MOTION: Move cultural resources out of cross cutting for Cordell Bank.

VOTE: Motion seconded, all votes ayes. No abstentions,

**ECOSYSTEM MONITORING:**

Ed Ueber supports Dan Howard's current work and goals. Ueber budgeted to keep the monitoring program intact despite loss of ship time. Use Delta to grid over Cordell Bank. Until more ship time is recovered don't take on new projects.

MOTION: It is a priority for Cordell Bank to coordinate existing monitoring programs; accept this statement "as is" for now but with potential editorial change.

VOTE: Motion seconded, voted to keep language (2 bullet) as is. No abstentions, no nays.

**COMMUNITY OUTREACH:**

MOTION: keep "as is."

VOTE: All 3 bulleted items aye'd as is with no abstention

**EXOTIC/INVASIVE SPECIES:**

MOTION/VOTE: put under Ecosystem Protection – specific to Cordell Bank.

**BOUNDARY ISSUES:**

VOTE: Internal group only, for now.

**EDUCATION:**

Accept change recommended by staff (joint for Cordell Bank & Gulf of the Farallones)

VOTE: motion passed, no abstentions.

LUNCH BREAK AT 1242

MEETING READJOURNED AT 13:35

**ECOSYSTEM PROTECTION:**

Remove red language – add invasive/exotic species.

Fishing impacts evaluation – Ecosystem dynamics to be outlined by Dan Howard.

Species list – Daniel Cohen asked for full species inventory list and suggested it be added to the Sanctuary's new website.

It was noted that the Council should substitute the term "Ecosystem" for "Biodiversity," per language preferences of this Administration.

MOTION: second to accept list as is.

VOTE: Unanimous approval.

**WATER QUALITY:**

A turbidity study is needed to define factors involved in the Sanctuary's high productivity. No anthropogenic effects were identified, but it was noted the Russian River plume can reach to halfway to Bank. "Water Quality" is not currently being affected significantly by humans.

Anne Walton clarified that Cordell Bank is set aside as a primarily research Sanctuary, to establish a baseline. Cordell is the only Sanctuary in the system without significant human impacts.

Dan Howard stated that current research constitutes mere snapshots, and will require more extensive study over the years.

Carol Keiper indicated that we are experiencing a new regime shift, the Pacific Decadal Oscillation, which may actually have cooling effects on ocean temperatures.

A working group would address specific questions.

MOTION: Adopt both bullets

VOTE: one abstention, all other ayes.

**ADMINISTRATION:**

Staff recommends Cordell should build a staff of own manager, education coordinator, research coordinator, administrative manager.

Moser stated that so many site-specific matters will require a fully independent staff, to focus energy and avoid conflicts. In order to develop Cordell as a research site this would be necessary.

MOTION: Accept language "as is"

VOTE: All aye votes.

### **RESEARCH:**

CBNMS should create a research entity, then disseminate its data to other researchers, the public, and other resource managers. Other programs would be supportive of research focus.

Question: would there be potential user conflicts to require permitting?

Proposed change: Structure and management. The question was raised, "why select Cordell as a research site?" Although Cordell Bank is different from other sites, the methodology can be carried over to others. Cordell Bank is one of very few sites that conduct its own research, vs. parceling it out to others.

Dan Howard proposed that this is a rare chance to do their own research, and encouraged this research directions be taken.

Tom Lambert proposed that maybe new methods developed in the course of Cordell's research can have value to other sites.

Carol Keiper supported the position that public access to Cordell Bank be maintained to provide public education opportunities.

Rick Powers expressed concern that fishers would not be in favor of Cordell being a research site, if that included some kind of zoning.

Josh Churchman indicated that the Farallon Islands are being turned into a research site privately zoned and wants to see Cordell Bank open to others in addition to researchers. Bill McMillon cited the example of Horseshoe Cove which was meant to be public access, but which has been withdrawn from the public after awhile.

Brady Phillips clarified the distinction between the activities of staff researchers vs. other research groups.

Council recommended the following be added:

- The primary goal of the Cordell Bank staff will be research.
- Ueber indicated that the current staff is now acting toward a research focus.

MOTION: Delete green bulleted item; let other language stand.

VOTE: No nays, no abstentions, unanimous acceptance.

### **PARTNERSHIPS FOR COMMUNITY GROUP:**

Ed Ueber presented a brief history of the Farallones Marine Sanctuary Association (FMSA). The Association initiating effort and funding were provided by Martha Kropf and her associates.

Council members can continue to work within community organizations; if Cordell's Council members wish to become active in founding an Association they must do it on their own time and at their own cost.

MOTION: leave language as is

VOTE: unanimous ayes.

Comments by Josh Churchman and Tom Lambert indicated that they felt their input was well represented in the current prioritization document.

### **MEETING RECONVENED AT 1446:**

### **WORKING GROUP RECRUITMENT.**

The Working Group advises the Sanctuary Manager and must be chaired by a Council member; if the issue is cross-cutting, it does not necessarily need to be chaired by one of our own Council members.

Staff have already been proposed on working groups – “staff lead person” Ueber indicated that staff names may change; the list reflects volunteers for the groups. Outside experts are also welcome, alternates, too.

Working groups will start to meet in November, and meetings will not continue later than April 2003. Expect a once per month meeting, requiring 5 hours total.

BOUNDARY ISSUES: Internal group only, for now. Mitchell Tartt  
Community Outreach – Julie Barrow, Rachel Sanders, Joe Smith.

Coordinated Management: Brady Philips, Ed Lindelof; 7 months long.  
(NOTE: This will not cover the boundary issue).

CULTURAL RESOURCES: This does not apply to Cordell Bank.

ECOSYSTEM MONITORING: Steve Gittings (national research head), Bill McMillon/SAC, Josh Churchman/SAC, Doreen Moser/SAC

FISHING: (INTERNAL) – to establish policy across all three Sanctuaries. Working Group/EXTERNAL) – apply parameters by internal group; will meet sequentially after first internal group meets. John Churchman and Rick Powers are both joining this group.

PARTNERSHIPS WITH COMMUNITY GROUPS: The Sanctuary can work with existing groups, or start up a new Association.

RESEARCH- Tom Lambert, Carol Keiper, Dan Cohen, and Rick Powers are interested.

WATER QUALITY: No volunteers came forward. Michael Carver is the CB staffer who may participate in this Group.

Bill McMillon expressed concern that the larger Monterey Bay Sanctuary Advisory Council will overwhelm smaller Councils.

Procedurally, Working Group recommendations should go through Advisory Council Chairs who will then pass them along to Anne Walton.

Anne Walton indicated that Working Group meetings are open to the public.

- END OF JMPR SEGMENT -

### **DAN HOWARD PRESENTATION, "SANCTUARY QUEST 2002"**

Sanctuary Quest 2002 was incredibly successful for continuing the monitoring efforts. We conducted a R/V MacArthur cruise in the Gulf of the Farallones at the end of May, and were slated for 10 days in Cordell Bank but 4 days were lost to rough weather. The cruise ran through June 4<sup>th</sup>.

They conducted daytime work with the ROV; the US Navy ran the ROV together with the Cordell Bank staff. Nighttimes were spent running sampling stations that were first established in 1997; this was the first time to rerun them since then.

Ecosystem Dynamics Study (EDS) vs. ROV dive sites. The research team conducted six dives in five working days. This September/October the Sanctuary will operate a two-man submersible. The NOAA research vessel MacArthur is 170

feet, carries 13 scientists, and operates typically for blocks of time from 7-10 days.

The Naval Phantom ROV with cameras focused dives in low-relief areas, then built up to higher relief. The ROV doesn't work well on line transects in high relief areas; it was impossible to retrace line transects.

The ROV is great for species inventory, but not for towing – in the high winds the McArthur acted as sail and dragged ROV around too much. The researchers found it best to set the ROV down on the sea bottom and film. They were able to use the “hot key” to mark different habitats, and can cross-reference the images with the location on the Bank. They used two trailers, the second trailer staying in contact with Howard's trailer so he could direct them. The team used sonar in rocky areas. Longlines were a common sight on the Bank in high relief areas.

The research team will be re-sampling sites under contract with the Moss Landing Marine Laboratory (MLML). Jill Baltan did chlorophyll-collecting using Conductivity, Temperature, Depth (CTD) instrument, and Jill processed the samples at MLML. The Health Department looked at toxic blooms.

Dale Roberts was doing acoustic transects to quantify prey. The researchers used a Tucker trawl at night at various levels in water column. Productivity in Gulf was incredible: the manta net plugging with krill and juvenile rockfish.

**NEXT CRUISE:** Benthic characterization. The Sanctuary will work with Mary Yoklavitch/NOAA Santa Cruz, and will evaluate data after the initial 3 years.

**MEETING ADJOURNED 1545**

**ANNOUNCEMENT:** The next Cordell Bank Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting is set for DECEMBER 10<sup>TH</sup> – Venue is to be announced.