



**CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL**

MEETING MINUTES

August 21, 2014

9:15 AM

Point Reyes National Seashore, Red Barn Classroom, Point Reyes Station, CA

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the meeting of the Sanctuary Advisory Council for Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS). The council is an advisory body to the sanctuary superintendent. The opinions and findings of this publication do not necessarily reflect the position of CBNMS and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

Call to Order/Welcome/Roll Call (George Clyde)

Advisory Council Chair George Clyde called the meeting to order at 9:16 AM.

George welcomed everyone; advisory council coordinator Lilli Ferguson then called roll.

Members and Alternates Present:

George Clyde (Chair; Community-at-Large - Marin)
Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large - Marin Alt.)
Bill Wolpert (Community-at-Large - Sonoma)
Sarah Hameed (Community-at-Large - Sonoma Alt.)
Todd Steiner (Conservation Alt.)
Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook (Education)
Noah Wagner (Fishing Alt.)
Kevin Krick (Vice Chair; Maritime Activities)
John Berge (Maritime Activities Alt.)
Jaime Jahncke (Research)
Pete Adams (Research Alt.)

Members of the CBNMS staff were also present:

Dan Howard (Sanctuary Superintendent)
Lilli Ferguson (Resource Protection Specialist and advisory council coordinator)
Jennifer Stock (Education and Outreach Coordinator)

Review and Approve Agenda (George)

The agenda was reviewed and unanimously approved by the advisory council.

Review and Approve June Meeting Minutes (George)

The June 25, 2014 meeting minutes were reviewed. George mentioned having a preference for summary minutes and less about who gave which views, unless there was a need to identify a particular person. Advisory council members agreed. The minutes were unanimously approved by the advisory council.

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report (Dan Howard)

Sanctuary Superintendent Dan Howard provided highlights of recent and upcoming activities.

Dan was out the week before the meeting on a cruise with a remotely operated vehicle (ROV) on Cordell Bank with Dani Lipski, Michael Carver and others. He described the work being done over about five weeks, in CBNMS and the proposed expansion areas of CBNMS and Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS). The emphasis was to set up long term monitoring for the shallow water invertebrate community on the Bank with focus on a hydrocoral species that may be impacted by climate change.

CBNMS may do some work with the Bay Area Underwater Explorers (BAUE) divers in October, assigning them some science tasks. BAUE dove Cordell Bank last October.

Jim Delgado, of the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) maritime heritage program will be doing some shipwreck surveys in GFNMS as part of this year's ROV operations. The Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS) cruise would be going out in September.

Work continued on the new CBNMS offices, including installing skylights in the meeting room.

With Whale Aware, Michael had been working hard with others and Jaime Jahncke was working on a website to get the information out; the desire was to have a "one stop shopping" site for whale observation data on the East and West coasts and increase awareness of the ocean environment and being good ocean stewards.

A CBNMS photo exhibit has just gone up at the Bay Model and will be up through September 29. There was a request to let the advisory council know when there were public events, such as receptions, associated with photo exhibits; Lilli said she would ask Jenny to let her know, and if she learned of any she would send the notices to the advisory council.

Jenny had 16 teachers for two days at Winged Ambassador workshops. In the field they learned about plastics monitoring with Five Gyres Institute.

Jenny led a field seminar out of Bodega Bay to Cordell Bank. It was 59 degrees at the Bank which was pretty warm. The next field seminar will have Doreen Gurrola as the naturalist.

Jenny will be leading a two-day training/field trip for the Oakland Museum Science Guild; one day would be a boat trip to Cordell Bank, with Carol Keiper as the naturalist for the trip. Prof. Tessa Hill from the Bodega Marine Laboratory will be giving a presentation, probably at Hog Island. She had been working on ocean acidification and the impact on different larval forms.

Advisory Council Business (Lilli)

Lilli reviewed that applicants were being sought for several advisory council positions, and that applications would be accepted through September 30.

The CBNMS Advisory Council Charter is due to expire in December. We will be updating the charter following the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) process.

The advisory council asked a few questions about the charter renewal. Lilli explained the charter is a site-specific charter, which follows the ONMS template – it is not a national charter that covers all the advisory councils.

Public Comment

There was none.

Proposed Boundary Expansion Update/Discussion (Dan)

Dan provided a brief update on proposed expansion area activities. NOAA has looked at the comments from the public comment period and looked for common themes for the responses to comments section of the final environmental impact statement. Once ready, NOAA would look to see what changes, if any, were needed to the project documents. There were over 820 submittals during the comment period and since some submittals had multiple comments, we received over 1,000 comments.

There was a question, were the military and the Coast Guard treated separately? They were discussed in the Homeland Security and Military Uses chapter of the EIS, and NOAA recognizes there are two separate agencies, the Department of Defense for the military and the Department of Homeland Security for the Coast Guard. Regarding the issue category about military opposition; there were several comments during the public comment period opposing military use of sanctuary areas.

There was a question if there was any potential for mariculture in CBNMS, far out from the coastline, and if it would be possible to allow that in CBNMS in the future as technologies advanced. Dan explained that type of project was not specifically prohibited in the CBNMS regulations. Some work is being done in Hawaii, in depths that are in the ballpark of CBNMS, but no such operations are known near the Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary. Any offshore mariculture proposal for CBNMS would need to ensure the project would be in compliance with all of the CBNMS regulations, including those that prohibit disturbance of the seabed and discharges. Dan reviewed that next, the proposed action would be edited, and he went through the process the agency would go through in making a final decision. There had been a lot of concern about including authorization as part of the proposed action, and NOAA was looking at that. There might be some action in the future on that topic for the advisory council's consideration.

George noted there had been a GFNMS advisory council meeting the day before this meeting, and there was a proposal at that meeting to consider one or more advisory council working groups on GFNMS regulations; it passed. Some GFNMS issues related to the proposed expansion may require further thought, such as authorization, motorized personal watercraft, and boundaries. Part of reason proponents passed the motion was they wanted to let ONMS know there were further considerations and they wanted to weigh in. The Chair, in consultation with the advisory council and the concurrence of the sanctuary superintendent, sets up advisory council working groups. He noted that was not on the agenda for this meeting to do that; he felt

discussion of possible future working groups could be done after NOAA's decision on the project was issued.

Another question was about if Office of Management and Budget (OMB) and Council on Environmental Quality (CEQ) reviewed the final action. CEQ normally does not review final EISs, unless something was raised about a particular EIS being inadequate. If OMB reviewed it, that would likely happen at a higher level, such as the Department of Commerce level. The Governor of California would review the final EIS. He would not be able to veto the CBNMS portion of the proposal as it was all proposed to be in federal waters.

A last question was if anyone had raised during the comment period that the Air Resources Board said it had authority out to 100 miles. The answer was it had not been raised.

Maritime Heritage Program, Oxford Search, and Redwood Coast Cultural Landscape Assessment (Jim Delgado)

Jim introduced himself as the director of the ONMS maritime heritage program. Bob Schwemmer works on maritime heritage issues on the West Coast. He pointed out that January 30 was the 40th anniversary of the creation of the first National Marine Sanctuary, the Monitor. He described the National Register of Historic Places, and that there must be no impacts to the places and resources on that list from a federal action, or they must be mitigated. He reviewed his involvement in a number of projects, including looking for shipwrecks associated with the Battle of the Atlantic, looking for wrecks in GFNMS, and records research. He told several compelling stories about how different ships had wrecked in U.S. waters, and why those shipwrecks may be important, including having a concrete record of historic and cultural events, for relevance to how family histories were shaped by the events, and as dive destinations. Media coverage of shipwrecks can get people interested in National Marine Sanctuaries, or in places they might want to nominate as National Marine Sanctuaries.

He reviewed was that ownership of wrecks in the present day, even after decades or hundreds of years, was important an important factor in what actions might be taken with them. In many cases, the U.S. government owns the wreck in U.S. waters; in other cases, foreign governments do, and the U.S. recognizes their claims of ownership. U.S. claims on shipwrecks in foreign waters are also recognized by foreign governments.

In the proposed CBNMS and GFNMS expansion area, NOAA is looking to connect people with the maritime cultural landscape and the environment. He said a maritime heritage landscape overview would be published for the Graveyard of the Atlantic soon, and after that, one would be published for CBNMS, GFNMS and the proposed expansion area. The area is rich in maritime history.

Jim talked about how NOAA gathers data on submerged resources. Sometimes it comes from NOAA's navigation response teams; sometimes from newspaper stories; and sometimes from technological investigation, including from probes, metal detectors, and remotely operated vehicles. The day after the advisory council meeting, he planned to go with George to look for the wreck of the Oxford in Tomales Bay (for which he had a permit). If solid structures were

found, when appropriate, NOAA would announce that. However, it would remain where it was and would not be raised.

Jim also provided an overview of CBNMS's maritime heritage. The sanctuary is special for its natural resources, being a part of the ocean highway and for people's mental connection to the coast. Records indicate there is a former Navy vessel in the proposed CBNMS expansion area, he noted. He told the story of the former Navy warship, which had been used in World War II, then was used by the Japanese as a patrol craft, and eventually came back to the U.S. Navy after the war. After that, the Navy made the decision to sink it in the Pacific. There were a number of surplus vessels at that time. A workshop was being planned for December to talk about deep water targets for oceanographic and maritime heritage research, including expanded CBNMS area. At that time, he hoped an ROV could be used to locate the wreck in CBNMS.

Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation Update (Tom Lambert)

Tom Lambert, President of the Board, provided an update. Liza Crosse, who served on the board for five years, resigned. She worked on a number of activities, including organizing a letter writing campaign that helped restore funding to ONMS; updating the Foundation's web site; and arranging a lecture in Fairfax, at which Dan and Jennifer spoke. He announced Lynette Kofinow had joined the board. One of her accomplishments has been to start a local chapter of the American Cetacean Society. Regarding the Foundation's updated web site, Tom said it was now easier to read and should result in more donations. He reviewed that he planned to leave the board in September. He had announced this last December but did not want to leave the board until a replacement on the board was determined.

Members' and Alternates' Reports (Advisory Council)

Kevin Krick reported he had an intern; one thing the intern was doing was work on the mystery of the holes on Cordell Bank [a project George has been researching, as reported at previous advisory council meetings].

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook reported that the Point Reyes National Seashore Association (PRNSA) and Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNS) had begun discussions to expand educational programming. UC Berkeley was developing an "Interns in the Parks" program, and PRNS would be partnering with UC Berkeley. Perhaps they could explore ways this might benefit CBNMS, she said. She also announced PRNSA was having a Pacific Plate fundraiser on Sept 20 to benefit PRNS education programs, trails maintenance, science in the park, interns, etc.

Todd Steiner said Turtle Island Restoration Network ("Turtle Island") had finished a teacher institute funded by the Bay Watershed and Education Training Program; they used salmon as an iconic species to connect the watershed. Jenny spoke during the event. He reported the California Court of Appeals found the Marin County Wide Plan environmental review was improper and that its proposed mitigations were inadequate. He said the County would be required to prepare a new supplemental Environmental Impact Report as it related to salmon protection in West Marin. The staff of the Salmon Protection And Watershed Network (SPAWN), a project of Turtle Island, is in negotiations with the County to produce a new Stream Conservation Ordinance to remedy the situation. There is also a Turtle Island initiative in development, the Community Salmon Land Trust (C-SALT). Its purpose would be to purchase properties along

salmon streams with a goal of restoring habitat, “greening” homes, and then reselling the homes (minus the property the houses sit on) as affordable/work force housing with permanent covenants that will maintain the homes in perpetuity. The land would remain within the ownership of the land trust. Separating the land from the homes would reduce the cost of ownership and help make the houses affordable. Todd also reported that, for the first time since a 2003 regulation was established, the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) had instituted a 25,000-square-mile time/area closure of the California driftnet fishery in Southern California to protect endangered loggerhead turtles during El Niño years when the animals moved north into Southern California waters. This action came after Turtle Island and the Center for Biological Diversity filed a lawsuit to ensure the protections were promulgated.

Sarah Hameed just returned from the International Marine Conservation Congress in Scotland; Lance Morgan was also there. There were talks on a number of topics including ocean acidification, how to better implement marine protected areas, marine debris, and dynamic management. She announced Bodega Marine Laboratory would be holding an open House September 13, with some funding from the Bodega Marine Science Association. The labs would be open, and there would be interactive displays. The local Surfrider groups had had a couple of fundraising events. She also mentioned the pending statewide ban on plastic bags and that Sonoma County had passed a ban on single use plastic bags.

George reported the National Marine Sanctuary System’s newly formed Business Advisory Council (BAC) would be meeting September 24 in Baltimore. He reviewed the representatives on the BAC, and mentioned two advisory council chairs were invited to go to that meeting and that he was one of them. He would provide a report at the next advisory council meeting, he said. Todd relayed he had heard some concerns about membership and that he was interested to have the advisory council hear about work from the BAC.

Jaime reported that the 39th ACCESS Partnership cruise, in July on the R/V Fulmar, was a success. This was the 11th year of sampling. Seabird and marine mammal data was collected using a NMFS data logging system, Spotter Pro, and Whale Alert 2.0. Oceanographic measurements, including sampling for ocean acidification, were made at stations along the transect lines. Blue whales, Cassin’s Auklets, and mixed foraging marine mammal and seabird foraging groups were observed at Cordell Bank and the proposed sanctuary expansion areas. Hypoxic waters were observed at depth at the western and eastern ends of Cordell Bank. He also reviewed a number of the other monitoring results and findings, including where and when seabirds, krill, blue whales and other species were, and overlaps among species. The next ACCESS cruise was coming up soon, he noted.

Dan mentioned there had been a late season lull in whale observations. June-July was the peak per the models, Jaime stated, with July being the highest for whales.

Jaime also reported the Point Blue lab team completed a cycle of visits to the Exploratorium, in which they demonstrated how Point Blue studies marine food webs using regurgitated pellets, feces and dropped fish, and plankton. He and Meredith Elliott are in communication with Cal Academy to initiate a similar program to the one at the Exploratorium.

George adjourned the meeting at 12:20 PM.