



# CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY

## Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Minutes

---

**April 25, 2013**

9:45am – 2:00pm

PRBO Conservation Science, Petaluma, CA

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

### **Welcome**

Advisory Council Chair, Lance Morgan, called the meeting to order at 9:50am

### **Roll Call**

#### Members present:

Lance Morgan (Chair, Conservation)

Jaime Jahncke (Research)

Kevin Krick (Maritime Activities)

Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large Marin Alt.)

Bill Wolpert (Community-at-Large Sonoma)

Sarah Hameed (Community-at-Large Sonoma Alt.)

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook (Education)

Brian Johnson (Gulf of the Farallones NMS)

LTJG Noëlle Kitenko (United States Coast Guard)

#### CBNMS staff:

Dan Howard (Superintendent)

Kaitlin Graiff (Advisory Council Coordinator, Research Specialist)

Jennifer Stock (Education and Outreach Coordinator)

Michael Carver (Deputy Superintendent)

Lilli Ferguson (Resource Protection Specialist)

### **Review Agenda**

The agenda was unanimously approved

### **Review of January Minutes**

The January 24, 2013 joint GFNMS-CBNMS meeting minutes were reviewed and approved with no changes. Lance motions to adopt January minutes as final, Kevin approves, Jaime seconds, all in favor

***January minutes accepted as final***

### **Council Officer Elections**

Council members voted by paper ballot for primary members previously nominated by the Council for Chair and Vice-chair. Results: George Clyde elected as Chair and Kevin Krick elected as Vice-chair.

Dan thanked Lance for his time leading the council as chair for the past six years.

### **Superintendent's Report (Dan Howard)**

- i. Dan introduced Lilli Ferguson as the newest member of the CBNMS team. Lilli transferred from the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary to work with CBNMS and GFNMS on the boundary expansion process. Lilli has extensive experience with NEPA processes, including Environmental

Impact Statements (EIS). Lilli will also transition into the role of CBNMS advisory council coordinator towards the end of the year.

- ii. Budget- expecting our site budget in the next three weeks. We are expecting at least a 5% cut as headquarters is dealing with sequestration, increased taxes, assuming the MPA center, and no PAC funding. The sequestration has essentially stopped all travel, especially travel to conferences.
- iii. Facilities –the structural engineers report was delivered and after a number of conversations, NOAA determined that CBNMS would be better off in another location other than current offices in red barn. The Park has offered space across from the administration buildings which is the best possible option because CBNMS office will still be in the Park HQ area and able to interact with Park staff. Move will likely happen in late summer/fall depending on how long it takes to upgrade buildings from residential to business occupation.
- iv. Pacific Fisheries Management Council Meeting (PFMC)- Maria Brown and Dan traveled to Portland for a PFMC meeting and presented an update on the proposed boundary expansion. They met with the California delegation in the morning and briefed them on scoping activities and answered questions from the state and fishermen. Maria and Dan presented a short description of the proposed expansion. There were comments by sub-committees –groundfish analysis program opposed expansion, habitat committee supported, and several committees did not comment. Public comment: received only two comments, one pro and one con. Generally the sentiment was cautious because of the uncertainty about the future and a misconception of Sanctuaries’ influence on managing fisheries despite this not being Sanctuaries’ mandate. The council will be sending a letter that will be included as public comment.
- v. Meeting schedule: Reschedule August 1st meeting to Aug 8<sup>th</sup> or some other time in August. We also need to schedule retreat date for the fall.

#### **Demo of Whale Spotter app.** (Michael Carver and Jaime Jahncke)

Michael projected the app and ran through an example of recording a whale observation. The biologists on South East Farallon Island (SEFI) are collecting whale sighting data from the light house. Questions from the council included: can the units be changed? A: yes. How can you differentiate between duplicate observations and how to record the observer’s level of expertise in species identification? A: these are important questions that are still being addressed in the database component of the app. Will database be publically available? A: for now, no, to discourage a potential increase in whale watching volume in whale hotspots. Has the app been tested on commercial vessels? A: plans to do so this summer. Also involving San Francisco Bay Pilots.

#### **Whale Aware** (Michael Carver)

In response to the recommendations from the Vessel Impacts joint working group which were 1) modify the configuration of the San Francisco Vessel Traffic lanes (going into effect June 2013) and 2) develop Dynamic Management Area (DMAs), the purpose of Whale Aware is to leverage the sighting network to obtain the data needed to determine the necessity of DMAs. Data will be collected from ACCESS cruises and from the whale spotter app used at lighthouse hill on SEFI and other points of land, whale watching boats, and over flights of shipping lanes. There will be trainings with mariners about data collection and an expert workshop with the National Marine Fisheries Service to determine thresholds for establishing a DMA.

#### **Education Report** (Jenny Stock)

- i. Hosting a teacher workshop at the Oakland museum on the Winged Ambassadors curriculum. These workshops are reaching a board range of teachers within California.

- ii. Oakland museum natural science gallery will be reopening on May 31<sup>st</sup>. Museum docents will teach a Cordell Bank focused education program from grades 3-5. The program focuses on analyzing submersible video and characterizing habitat types.
- iii. Jenny showed some of the photos for the Cordell Bank traveling photo exhibit. First install of the exhibit is at the Point Reyes library and will be there until July. Jenny is also looking for new places to install. There are 39 images in total and she could put up some or all. Jenny would like to have them installed at least 3 months/year

#### **Research Update** (Kaitlin Graiff)

- i. ACCESS season will begin in May and include three six day cruises in May, July and September on the R/V Fulmar.
- ii. Cordell Bank staff is planning for an ROV cruise to characterize the invertebrate community on the Bank. The cruise will employ the expertise of West Coast Sanctuary Staff, the Sanctuaries ROV and the R/V Fulmar.
- iii. Technical SCUBA divers from the Bay Area Underwater Explorers (BAUE) are planning to charter a dive cruise on Cordell Bank in the fall. The BAUE team is working with Cordell Bank staff for permits and offered to collect underwater video and still images of the Bank for education and outreach purposes.

#### **Boundary expansion process and summary of SeaWeb workshop** (Lilli Ferguson and Dan Howard)

##### NEPA Timeline:

1. Scoping: Dec. 1 2012-March 1, 2013. Three public scoping meetings held during this timeframe, along with Sea Web SAC workshop.
2. Develop DEIS, draft related documents: Spring 2013-Fall 2013. Comments analyzed; study area & proposed project described; environmental effects analyzed; preferred alternative selected. Other documents drafted. Internal reviews.
3. Reviews and Public Comment on DEIS: Fall 2013-Spring 2014. Consultations required by law conducted, such as, but not limited to, those for the Endangered Species Act, National Historic Preservation Act, Coastal Zone Management Act, etc. Public meetings held on DEIS, and public comments on DEIS accepted during comment period and joint or individual SAC meetings to be scheduled for this period (likely a 2.5 month range). Congressional and Governor review of DEIS (45 days of continuous session of Congress).
4. Publish FEIS, Final Docs.; Decision Effective. Spring 2014-Summer/Fall 2014. Consider input received and revise EIS and related documents as needed. After FEIS is published, there is a 30-day cooling off period, then the final rule is published. After another Congressional and Governor review (45 days of continuous session of Congress), notice of effectiveness published, then decision effective.

#### *SeaWeb Workshop debrief* (Dan Howard)

A summary of the workshop can be found online at:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13\\_02\\_workshop/sac\\_workshop\\_summaryfeb2013.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_02_workshop/sac_workshop_summaryfeb2013.pdf)

Dan highlighted that the top two issues discussed at the workshop were aquaculture and alternative energy.

#### *Summary of the comments received from scoping process* (Lilli Ferguson)

- Comments were posted on the web portal Regulations.gov. 300 submissions of comments were filed. A number of the submissions had attachments. One submission may have multiple comments. Some of the comments were opinions if they were for or against expansion and focused on specific topics. Some asked questions like: what's the purpose for NMS and what's NOAA's authority for proposing the expansion in this way? Some people suggested

modifications to the boundaries. Some people asked about the physical environment and described biological hotspots, invasive and endangered species, cultural and historic resources. There were a lot of the comments related to human uses like offshore aquaculture, offshore energy (oil and gas exploration) recreational fishing, commercial fishing, marine algae harvest, commercial vessel traffic, tourism, mineral exploration, fiber optics, desalination plants, military and coast guard usage, etc. There were also questions on how the Sanctuaries will interact with other agencies (NMFS, PFMC) and about the working relationships with other west coast sanctuaries such as plans to enforce regulations, SAC representation, and research and education activities.

- Noelle asked if funding for expansion came up during public comment. A: this did come up and some programs will need funding, but others like responding to oil spills will have restoration funds. Sanctuaries will continue to collaborate and partner with other agencies. The budget will not be written in the EIS
- 2014 SAC meeting dates will be scheduled appropriately with EIS process and may be held jointly with GFNMS.
- Management plan revisions are also taking place to address activities in the expansion area.

#### **Discussion: council representatives for ports & harbors and fishing (Dan Howard)**

Dan wanted to have a discussion with the Council is they should create a Ports and Harbors seat on the Council (by amending the Charter) or incorporate a representative for this constituency in an existing seat. Comments: Ports and Harbors representative could sit in the fishing seat since they work directly with the fishing community. If the two fishing seats, that have remained vacant for years can be filled, then consider adding the new ports and harbors seat. If the seat was a government seat there would not be term limits. The fishing seat can be recreational and commercial and the pool for fishing and ports and harbors to recruit from is low. Consider the expansion area and getting a fisherman from the north on the council. Dan was approached by two fishermen at the boundary expansion public scoping meetings who may be interested in serving on the Council. The ports and harbors seat could be filled by the Bodega Bay harbor master. Lilli's advice is to be careful about creating new seats when potential member pools are low since the seat may stay empty for a long time. So it could be best for the ports and harbors person to be in the fishing seat since they are engaging with those constituents. Nonetheless, the fishing seat should not be eliminated. The National Marine Fisheries Service Seat (NMFS) has been empty for some time and would need to be filled by someone from the Santa Rosa office although no appropriate persons for this seat have been identified.

#### **Public Comment**

Tom Lambert – *President of the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation.*

Tom highlighted the Foundations recent activities with public talks with Dan and Jenny, tabling at the San Francisco Ocean Film Festival, and providing funds for the Whale Spotter app. Two Foundation members attended two of the three boundary expansion public scoping meetings. They also provided comments. Dan, Michael and Tom attended the memorial service for Joe Smith – founder of the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation. The Cordell Foundation also signed onto a letter from the National Foundation supporting sanctuary budgets. Tom introduced Patty Fata, the newest Foundation board member.

#### **Member Reports**

*Lance Morgan* – Ocean Awareness and Green Flea Market at his son's school on May 5<sup>th</sup>, Santa Rosa.

*Sarah Hameed* – Sonoma County Surf Rider is holding an event to ban plastic bags. Sarah sent out CAMEOS presentation announcement. The students will be presenting their work in a science symposium format. Many of the presentations are marine science related and some are terrestrial

ecologists. If you plan on attending please RSVP so they can account for attendance. Sarah will also email the list of presentations for the BML science seminar series.

*Noëlle Kitenko* - Brad Soule has moved on from the USCG and his replacement is Cody Dunagan.

*Bill Wolpert*—Bill attended the Sonoma Ocean Climate Campaign. Sonoma clean energy just passed the board of supervisors.

*Jaime Jahncke—Farallon Update:* The seabird season has started off quickly with a very large early breeding push by Cassin's Auklets. As of the last check, there was over 70% occupancy in the nest boxes. This is exceptionally good for early April and is likely a sign (along with the preponderance of pink poop) that krill remains abundant around the island. The first murre egg, the earliest ever, was observed on March 12<sup>th</sup>. There has also been a large amount of Tufted Puffin activity for this early in the year. *ACCESS Update:* Science section of website updated to 2012. Tentative dates for 2013 cruises have been set for May 25-30 (OR June 22-27), July 24-29 and September 24-29. *Vessel Traffic Update:* Caitlin Jensen, Nancy Foster Fellow, SFSU, Advisor Ellen Hines, worked with Stellwagen Bank NMS staff to learn methodologies around AIS data. Compared 2011 results to 2009 data, and have already seen some interesting things including an increase in the distance traveled by cargo ships in the western shipping lanes for 2011. In 2009, there were about 12,000 nautical miles traveled by cargo ships in the western shipping lanes - whereas 2011 shows over 30,000 nautical miles traveled in these lanes. Along with this, also noticed a big drop in the number of vessels in the south inbound traffic lane - it decreased from 472 vessels in 2009 to just 280 in 2011. The proportion of these vessels that were cargo ships decreased by 30%. Could assume that the 2008 Fuel Rule is responsible for these changes.

*Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook*—new director hired for PRNSA, formerly from the Nature Conservancy. Science at the Seashore Program is growing. Leslie's son is working on a video about albatross and plastic and messages for what people can do to reduce the introduction of plastics into the ocean. Discussed proposed education cuts for NOAA, including B-WET, and Teacher-at-Sea.

*Mike Cummings*—asked Dan about the status of the Russian River Habitat Blue Print. A: There are multiple projects in existence to leverage from, such as The National Weather Service is working on establishing meteorological stations in the vineyards to predict when there will be frosts so that the grape growers don't need to continually spray their grapes in times of no frost. The Blue Print is identifying projects across NOAA line offices that have benefit and value in the Russian River watershed and are developing the plan.

*Kevin Krick*—Michael Carver provided Kevin with some slides for a presentation he gave to the environmental representatives of the world shipping carriers. They wanted to learn about the changes to the vessel traffic lanes. They appreciated the concept of the dynamic management areas versus seasonal changes.

*Brian Johnson*—Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan is in the final stages. Staff is working on boundary expansion process.

Meeting adjourned at 2:15pm.