



CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY

Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Minutes

April, 21 2011

9:30 am – 2:00 pm

Point Reyes National Seashore, Red Barn Classroom

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

Welcome

Advisory Council Chair, Lance Morgan, called the meeting to order at 9:35am

Roll Call

Members present:

Lance Morgan (Council Chair and Conservation)

George Clyde (Council Vice-Chair and Community-at-Large Marin)

Vic Chow (Education)

Kevin Krick (Maritime Activities)

John Berge (Maritime Activities Alt.)

Todd Steiner (Conservation Alt.)

Bill Wolpert (Community-at-Large Sonoma)

Jaime Jahncke (Research)

LT Steve Arnwine (USCG Living Marine Resources Officer)

Carol Bernthal (Acting Director, West Coast Region)

CBNMS staff:

Dan Howard (CBNMS superintendent)

Kaitlin Graiff (CBNMS Advisory Council Coordinator)

Michael Carver (Resource Protection Specialist)

Review Agenda

The agenda was unanimously approved

Review of November Minutes

The February 17, 2011 meeting minutes were approved with no changes

Lance motioned to adopt November minutes as final, George approved, Todd seconds, all in favor

February minutes accepted as final

Manager's Report (Dan Howard)

Dan introduced Carol Bernthal, acting director for the West Coast Region NMS

- i. Budget: Anticipates FY11 budget for the office of National Marine Sanctuaries will be finalized by May. It will likely be the expected 5% cut from FY10 budget. Bay Watershed Education and Training Program (B-WET) funding for FY11 was cut. NOAA's climate service was not funded.
- ii. CBNMS staffing: CBNMS GIS specialist, Pam van der Leeden, has taken a position with LSA associates. Research Coordinator, Lisa Etherington, has taken a position at Glacier Bay National

- Park as the chief of natural resources. Lisa's position will be filled and looking for a candidate with a PhD or Masters in marine ecology.
- iii. Pacific Fisheries Management Council (PFMC) has initiated their 5 year review of essential fish habitat (EFH). One part of this EFH review will consider information for habitats of particular concern (HAPC). Cordell Bank is recognized as HAPC with a regulation that prohibits the use of any bottom contact gear. The PFMC review of EFH will be an 18 month process, which the site will be following closely. The council suggested that they write a letter to PFMC to modify the "butterfly-fly" shaped closure in CBNMS. Carol suggested that all recommendations from sanctuaries and sanctuary advisory councils should be presented to the PFMC as one package. Dan will follow up at the next meeting regarding the best time for the council to submit recommendations to PFMC for EFH modification.
 - iv. Salmon Season: recreational season opened April 1, commercial season opens May 1 and it will be a full season. The decision was based on the number of jacks that returned to natal streams in 2010. Recreational catch size has been increased from 22 to 24 inches.
 - v. Council Members: Jaime Jahncke is primary research seat. George will continue as primary Marin Community at large and vice chair. The alternate seats for Marin County and Research and Fishing will be re-advertised.

Education Report (Dan Howard for Jenny Stock)

- i. Jenny's working part time again and will be hosting the Ocean Currents radio shows on KWMR, speakers are scheduled through August. More information on the CBNMS website
- ii. Oakland Museum: exhibit planning is coming along. Dan and Jenny have been providing information and interpretive theme development for the space. They are developing a 5-6 foot replica of the upper reef top of Cordell Bank; planning on opening in June, 2012.
- iii. Jenny is presenting at the Pt. Reyes Birding and Nature Festival April 29th, on Cordell Bank as a hotspot in the California Current, specifically for birds. CBNMS is a co-sponsor of the event and there are numerous workshops, walks, talks going on that weekend (see calendar on CBNMS website for more info).
- iv. California Signage Plan – there will be California National Marine Sanctuaries signs installed in north and south bound Cal Trans. rest areas. We are piloting the use of QR codes that are read by "smart phones" and lead users to the website. This will allow sanctuaries to analyze how many people saw the sign and accessed the web through the QR codes to get more information.
- v. We are recruiting a Teacher At Sea to join the ACCESS cruise this July. If anyone wants to help get the word out or knows of a teacher that may be interested, email Jenny for the info and she'll get the application forms to you.

Research Report (Kaitlin Graiff)

- i. ACCESS (Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies) cruises are right around the corner – first one in May on the R/V John Martin and additional cruises in June, July and Sept. Lisa and Jaime submitted a proposal to the California Landscape Conservation Cooperative to develop the capacity to study ocean acidification as part of our ongoing ACCESS cruises. The main objectives of the proposal are: Develop a method for monitoring of ocean acidification, using standard, simple, and cost effective ocean instrumentation; Translate this capability to other marine managed areas and regions; Guide future management decisions to protect vulnerable habitats and key species; and Provide a training forum for educators to develop collaborative strategies for communicating ocean acidification, disseminating educational materials, and inspiring stewardship actions among our collective audiences.

- ii. CBNMS still plans to use an autonomous underwater vehicle (AUV) to conduct a broad-scale characterization of deep sea coral/sponge habitats and communities in Bodega Canyon using still camera observations in August this year. This project is being funded by the coral reef conservation program and collaboration with Dr. Elizabeth Clarke of NOAA Fisheries-Northwest Fisheries Science Center as well as Guy Cochrane of USGS-Santa Cruz.
- iii. Analysis of underwater video collected during last year's Deep Sea Coral cruise is nearly complete. The next steps are to create summary figures and statistics of the habitat and species communities. This information will be compiled in a data report with the same format for the other legs of the coral cruise. The ocean chemistry work conducted during the night operations of the coral cruise has also been analyzed. Nutrient samples and salinity samples were analyzed at the University of Washington Oceanography Technical Services Marine Chemistry Laboratory. Dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) and total alkalinity (TA) samples were analyzed at the NOAA Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory.
- iv. California Academy of Sciences (CAS) is making progress with the cataloging and digitization of slides collected by Cordell Expeditions. A large portion of the digitization work will be completed in the Academy's Project Lab located on the main floor of the Academy's exhibit space to provide a demonstration of the processes involved in preserving these historic images. The Archives Assistant doing the work is also writing blogs to further public awareness of the project, the Cordell Bank Marine Sanctuary and the availability of the images. <http://www.calacademy.org/blogs/library/> post there from April 19
- v. The video and photos collected during the October diver cruise will be analyzed for invertebrate species and compared to photos and species list developed by Cordell Expeditions. CAS has cataloged pretty much all of the material they identified from the October cruise and from the historical samples.
- vi. Due to budget shortfalls all of the education and research coordinators will not be holding their annual meetings. In substitute, is a trimmed down joint meeting of the 4 regional representatives from the education and research teams. This is also the case for the advisory council coordinators meeting. The representatives from the four regions will hold a one day meeting and each council chair will meet for 2 days at Gray's Reef NMS in Savannah Georgia.

Resource Protection (Michael Carver)

- i. Conducting over flights with United States Coast Guard (USCG) C130 aircraft. We are documenting vessels use in the sanctuary for all vessels that don't have an Automatic Information System (AIS). This information will be used for vessel issues working group. This group was formed to focus on ship strikes to marine mammals and ocean noise.
- ii. Michael and Steven Arnwine have been conducting trainings at USCG stations in Alameda, Sacramento and Bodega Bay about sanctuary regulations.
- iii. USCG fire arms trainings and search and rescue trainings have been moved outside of sanctuary boundaries.
- iv. George asked if there is publically available information for enforcement citations and violations within Sanctuaries. Sanctuaries have to rely on National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) enforcement agents for enforcement and their support has been challenged by declining funds. The NMFS law enforcement representative on the council (Dayna Mathews) can no longer attend meetings due to limited travel funds. Carol suggested that it would be beneficial for the West Coast Sanctuary Advisory Councils to weigh in on the importance, value and need of enforcement in sanctuaries. This could be a general statement that there is an ongoing need in sanctuaries for enforcement and regular reporting of actions in sanctuaries to leverage the case for NMFS to have more enforcement.

Lance wants it marked in the notes that the Council will revisit this topic at a future council meeting.

- v. The first meeting for the vessel issues working group is scheduled for May 10, 2011 at 9:30am at the Gulf of the Farallones NMS office.
- vi. Vessel spills working group (joint working group with Gulf of the Farallones council to focus on the use oil spill response technologies) will hold their first meeting in the summer.

Break

Update from the West Coast Region (Carol Bernthal)

Carol introduced herself and explained that she is serving as the West Coast Regional (WCR) Director until September 2011, until Bill Durous returns from serving as the Deputy Director for the Sanctuary program. She has been superintendent of the Olympic Coast National Marine Sanctuary (OCNMS) for 11 years. She thanked the advisory council for their work and their perspectives on complex sanctuary management needs.

Background on the WCR: in 2003 the sanctuary program had grown in complexity such as elevating from single species or complex ecosystem management. So there was a need for a regional structure. The WCR helps facilitate the internal coordination among the West Coast sites. The region also participates on regional issues beyond sanctuary boundaries – such as expanding existing sanctuary boundaries and establishing new sites.

Current WCR initiatives: West Coast Deep Sea Coral cruises within the region to help the PFMC in their review of EFH. The FY11 effort includes: multibeam habitat characterization and remotely operated vehicle (ROV) surveys in the OCNMS, AUV surveys in Bodega Canyon (CBNMS), multibeam characterization in Gulf of the Farallones NMS, and surveys of two seamounts off the Canadian coast. The WCR also serves with policy coordination such as vessel spill issues, whale strikes and boundary expansion/new sanctuaries. There has been interest in creating a new sanctuary off the Klamath River and expanding the Monterey Bay NMS southern area off the coast of San Luis Obispo.

There is also coordinated work with the education team with exhibits and signage for WC sanctuaries. Carol did an annual briefing with congressional members in Washington DC and they are supportive of the work that sanctuaries are doing, despite the tough economic environment. The work that sanctuaries do needs to be framed to the socioeconomic value of sanctuaries to local communities and the nation as a whole.

Budget: The budget has been assigned to NOAA and waiting to see how it is distributed to ONMS. Big hits in the budget were the removal of all earmarks such as BWET. The outlook for FY12 budget will require the program to be efficient and share resources and to further develop external partnerships. There also needs to be prioritization on elements to continue on for which the region can help support sites in taking a long term view on things.

Lance asked if there could be opportunities in California for the NOAA Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) initiative. Carol thinks there is potential for opportunities, once the NOAA MSP team gets funded and the regional bodies have been established. She sees that sanctuaries have been doing MSP (i.e. vessel issues working group). Also, the Sentinel Sites concept for sanctuaries could leverage and market external partners to do work in sanctuaries.

National Marine Sanctuaries of the West Coast Ocean Acidification Action Plan (Dan Howard)

The Action Plan was developed by the West Coast Ocean Acidification Task Force in response to the Ocean Acidification (OA) resolutions passed by all five west coast Advisory Councils.

Members of the Task Force: Dave Lott - WCR, Ed Bowlby - OCNMS, Dan Howard - CBNMS, Kelley Higgason - GFNMS, Karen Grimmer - MBNMS, Laura Francis - CINMS, Linda Krop - CINMS SAC, Richard Feely - PMEL, Libby Jewett - NCCOS

The challenge was to have realistic goals addressing OA issues. The team developed strategies and activities with budgets.

Dan ran through the actions and strategies. The seven strategies are: 1. Monitoring 2. Research 3. Education and outreach 4. Mitigating damages to sanctuary resources 5. Influencing national policy 6. Demonstrate leadership by reducing carbon emissions 7. Internal coordination on ocean acidification issues

Carol had two questions for the council: 1) does the Action Plan meet their expectations in regards to the OA resolution they passed? 2) Does the council identify any of the actions in the Plan as being a higher priority for CBNMS?

Group discussion: George thinks the document well informs the issue of OA and is very specific. Bill recognizes the need and value for baseline information of sanctuary water chemistry. John asked about the baseline numbers for OA for the West Coast. There has been preliminary work done by Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory (PMEL). Lance recognizes that this is a big plan and felt that monitoring and education and outreach should be the site priorities. He also noted that presenting messages to the general public about climate change is not as scientifically direct as measuring OA. He doesn't know of any other mitigation for OA that is occurring other than with oyster larvae. Jaime thinks research and mitigation are important, but sees the challenge mitigating for OA. He asked if there was any NOAA OA money? So far the money has gone through PMEL.

Public Comment

Tom Lambert, President of the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation - Foundation was formed 2 years ago and they are now spreading the word about themselves and have sent out a press release. So far they have an invitation to attend an Earth Day celebration from Assembly member Jared Huffman. There will be an article about the foundation in the West Marin Citizen. The best way to promote themselves is face to face and necessary to move forward to providing funding for research and education programs at the site.

- Kevin asked if the foundation can leverage how the sanctuary will benefit the socioeconomic values of Marin, Sonoma, and San Francisco communities. John suggests working with tourism bureaus along the coast.

Lunch

San Francisco Community Fishing Association (Dan Howard)

Played a quick video about the San Francisco Community Fishing Association (SFCFA) to give the council background information on the cooperative. The SFCFA will be putting in a request to the PFMC for an exempted fishing permit (EFP) for a hook and line fishery in the Rockfish Conservation Area (RCA) in Cordell Bank and Gulf of the Farallones Sanctuaries. There would be 100% observers and the EFP aims to demonstrate that they can harvest the mid-water schooling fishes with minimal or no bycatch of other fish species of concern. Dan's perspective is that this is a sustainable hook and line fishery with minimal bycatch and habitat damage, and the type of fishery Sanctuaries should support. He sees an opportunity to work with the SFCFA and National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) to maximize data collection from

this fishery. Cordell Bank to 50 fathoms has been closed for 10 yrs and if the SFCFA can demonstrate that they can fish “cleanly” with the EFP they will likely go back to PFMC and ask for extension. CBNMS had supported a similar EFP in the past, although the EFP was denied when the PFMC was not considering any EFP proposals in 2010.

This particular EFP would not be submitted until 2012. Lance thinks it’s a proactive response for the sanctuary to support a clean fishing method. Bill thinks that the council should visit this further and at a future meeting have a representative from the SFCFA talk to the council as well as someone with stock assessment expertise. Questions that came up during the discussion were: What happens if a decline in average fish size with increased effort is observed? How would the permit restrictions be enforced? What is the perspective from NMFS? These questions could be addressed at a joint meeting with Gulf of the Farallones advisory council.

Member Reports

Kevin Krick: Attended meeting on the East Coast to address vessel speed and ship strikes to Northern Right whales. There are speed restrictions and seasonal regulations, however when the pilot boards the vessel they don’t have to comply with the speed laws. He also attended a meeting in Long Beach: North American Marine Environment Protection Association and there was a panel addressing marine mammals and vessels.

George Clyde: Recent interest in making Tomales Bay a no discharge zone in response to proposal by Nicks Cove restaurant to operate eco-tours on the Bay.

Todd Steiner: their BWET grant is still in place for this year. SPAWN is monitoring Steelhead and Coho smolts in Lagunitas watershed. He attended and participated on a panel at The International Sea Turtle Association meeting in San Diego. Filed lawsuit against NMFS to address the West Coast critical habitat for Leatherback sea turtles. SPAWN is hiring for a restoration ecologist and managing director.

Bill Wolpert: updated from Sarah Hameed: the Sonoma Surfrider Chapter is still very focused on water quality issues for the Russian River and concerned about the proposed low-flow, or "fish flow", water management plan for that watershed. There is also concern that abalone divers don’t know the location and regulations for the North Central MPAs

Jaime Jahncke: Pam Michael, the first graduate student to use ACCESS data, from Hawaii Pacific University is defending her thesis in two weeks. Another student, Jen McGuan, at Sonoma State University is looking at hotspots for seabirds breeding on the Farallon Islands and to address areas of aggregations for response to oil spills. Sarah Hameed is interested in looking at the crab larvae from ACCESS cruises.

Vic Chow: Cal Pass – a state funded nonprofit association that keeps a database on students performance hosted a recent conference addressing the hurdles high school students went through in their science and math classes. Bodega Marine Lab’s GK-12 program: CAMEOS (Coastal Atmospheric Marine Environmental Observing Studies) will host multiple presentation sessions of the high school students projects.

Lance Morgan: Gave an overview of the SAC Chairs meeting and reviewed agenda. He will be attending the International Marine Conservation Congress in Victoria, British Columbia

Meeting Adjourned at 2:30 pm