



CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY

Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Minutes

April 8, 2010

9:45 am – 12:00 pm

Point Reyes National Seashore Association Conference Rm.

12:00 pm – 4:15 pm

Joint Session with Gulf of Farallones National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council
Point Reyes National Seashore Red Barn Classroom

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

Welcome

Advisory Council Chair, Lance Morgan, called the meeting to order at 9:55am

Roll Call

Members present:

Lance Morgan (Council Chair and Conservation)

George Clyde (Council Vice-Chair and Community-at-Large Marin)

Ed Smith (Research)

Jaime Jahncke (Research Alt.)

Vic Chow (Education)

Bill McMillon (Education Alt.)

Liza Crosse (Community-at-Large Marin Alt.)

Dan Howard (CBNMS superintendent)

Other staff present:

Kaitlin Graiff (CBNMS SAC coordinator and research specialist)

Michael Carver (CBNMS resource protection and operations coordinator)

Jennifer Stock (CBNMS Education and Outreach coordinator)

Review Agenda

The agenda was unanimously approved with no changes

Review of February Minutes

The February 4, 2010 meeting minutes were approved with no changes

Lance motions to adopt February minutes as final, George approves, Ed Seconds, all in favor

February minutes accepted as final

Manager's Report (Dan Howard)

- i. Leadership meeting/Hill visits: Met with Representatives Lynn Woolsey and Mike Thompson; discussed sanctuary expansion bill which has had little movement this year, the bill probably needs to be attached to a larger bill. Rep. Thompson is still interested in designating northern California sanctuaries to prohibit oil and gas development on the west coast. Area off of

Klamath River could be a potential area for a new Sanctuary. Rep. Thompson has a Sea Grant fellow working in his office on this issue.

- ii. Budget: National program priority (NPP) funds were awarded for the Cordell Bank Reef Crest dive project; NOAA Maritime Heritage Program divers
- iii. Regional Leadership Meeting (West Coast Sanctuaries): Goal of meeting is to increase regional efficiencies and develop regional priorities for the sanctuaries. One day of meeting was on the Google campus to discuss partnership with Sanctuaries about getting information out about the ocean, i.e. at visitor centers. On the new version of Google Earth, the ocean layer is on by default.
- iv. R/V Fulmar: days had to be cut due to funding
- v. Cordell Bank Office Expansion: constructions plans are almost finished; breaking ground in September

Education Report (Jennifer Stock)

- i. ACES teacher workshop: June 28th-30th, partnership with Cal Academy; funded by CA Coastal Commission Whale Tail Grant; curriculum for grades 7-12; lessons are based on concepts of physical and biological processes in the ocean, to be correlated to animal migrations
- ii. Science on a Sphere: has been installed at the Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNS) visitor center; PRNS is the first national park to have a science on a sphere; Jenny is working with the park to identify ocean and climate themes to be displayed on the sphere.
- iii. Tracking Black-footed Albatross: Requested NPP funds for WCR and Pacific Islands region to build on Black-footed albatross tracking data collected in partnership with the ACES program (Animals in Curriculum Based Ecosystem Studies). The goals are to analyze the data in more detail, specifically in association with bathymetric features in the Pacific, marine protected areas and identifying areas of risk. Additionally, funds are also being used to provide education activities and datasets to teachers through the ACES program, that CBNMS and Oikonos have worked on in the past few years. .
- iv. BWET (Bay Watershed Education and Training Program): expanding to Sonoma County this year. Sonoma County schools/organizations will be able to apply. Will be hosting a workshop to help potential applicants apply.
- v. Expedition Pages: on website will be created this year for the West Coast Deep Sea Coral Cruise and Cordell Bank Reef Crest Cruise to communicate the science themes associated with these projects.
- vi. CBNMS NEW Website: should be launching in May.
- vii. Clem Miller Env. Ed Center: Jenny will be presenting CBNMS education resources to teachers who bring their classes to the center

Research Report (Kaitlin Graiff)

Lots of cruise planning has been happening in the last few months:

- i. ACCESS: Applied California Current Ecosystem studies; collaborative effort with PRBO conservation Science, CBNMS and GFNMS; Data collected during these cruises includes: abundance/distribution of birds and marine mammals, relative abundance of plankton (primarily krill) and physical oceanographic conditions; Cruises will take place in May, June, July and September; new near shore lines within GFNMS have been added in 2010; CBOMP grid is also planned to be conducted
- ii. Deep Sea Coral cruise (June): West coast cruise on NOAA ship McArthur II (OCNMS, CBNMS, GFNMS, CINMS) 2nd leg of cruise is within CBNMS/GFNMS in June (18th-25th). CBNMS staff will

be onboard along with NOAA-NCCOS (National Center Coastal Ocean Studies) staff will be contributing expertise in coral sampling and taxonomy and USGS will be providing geological expertise on the cruise. An ROV will be used for deep sea coral exploration in target areas: 1) slope region of CBNMS 2) Bodega Canyon (within CBNMS potential expansion area) 3: Hard bottom shelf. Night operations of CTD transects and water-chemistry measurements will be conducted by Texas A&M. Education and outreach components will include west-coast wide media activities and a sanctuary expedition page

- iii. Cordell Bank Reef Crest (October 5th-12th, on R/V Fulmar): Initial planning with Office of National Marine Sanctuaries technical divers. The goals of the project are to:
 - a. Test the feasibility of using technical divers for accomplishing science missions on Cordell Bank
 - b. Collect abundance and distribution data of invertebrates and fishes on the upper reef crest/pinnacles of Cordell Bank to develop a future monitoring program
 - c. Collect voucher specimens for identification; target tunicates for identifying a potential invasive species; target hydrocoral (*Stylaster sp.*) for genetic and reproductive analyses.
 - d. Revisit some of the historic dive sites visited in the 1970s by divers from Cordell Expeditions
 - e. Collect high definition video and photos for education and outreach products
- iv. Cordell Bank Buoy: Plans for re-deployment this month by staff from Bodega Marine Lab.
- v. NOAA Nancy Foster scholarship recipient: Pam Michael, will be working at the CBNMS office this summer. Pam is a master's student at Hawaii Pacific University and will be joining us from June 1st to August 31st. The focus of Pam's project: to evaluate associations of Black-footed Albatross to bathymetric features, including seamounts and banks, in North central California waters and also examine the effects of fisheries (such as longline and trawl) to BFAL distribution.
- vi. Plankton Samples: collected during a series of cruises in different years were inventoried and donated to PRBO for further analysis
- vii. Western Groundfish Conference: Dale Roberts will be presenting a poster at the conference addressing changes in fish size, abundance, and recruitment on Cordell Bank from 2002 to 2005 and in response to fishing closures.

Resource Protection (Michael Carver)

- i. Fulmar: schedule has been cut due to funding, a fluorometer (provides data on chlorophyll a) will be installed to the underway system
- ii. Enforcement Guide: working with enforcement partners; with addition of summary settlement authority will have ability to write tickets in the field. .
- iii. Marine Protected Areas (MPA) enforcement: four flights are scheduled on the NOAA Twin Otter Aircraft; collecting data on vessels using the sanctuary and providing the coordinates to enforcement agents if breaking regulations.

Public comment

John Berge (Pacific Merchant Shipping Association) works with the dry cargo shipping industry; interested in applying for maritime activities seat.

Council Executive Committee (EC) (George Clyde)

- Charter outlines: the council EC would meet between public sessions to address matters such as: consideration of awards, review of council applications, if members need to weigh in/discuss big issues.
- All primary council members make up the executive committee.
- Dan will make a few edits to the charter; will circulate updated charter within the week

George motions for approval of the Council Executive Committee Charter, Lance approves, Ed seconds, all in favor

CB Council Executive Committee Charter (with Dan's revisions) accepted unanimously

SAC Summit/Coordinators Meeting Update (Kaitlin Graiff)

- SAC Summit (May 11-13th) and SAC coordinators (May 14-15) meeting
- Lance and Kaitlin will have the opportunity to talk with Dan Basta about SAC related ideas and issues, so if you have an idea for a potential topic please provide them to Lance or Kaitlin

Salmon as a Sanctuary Resource Discussion (Dan Howard)

Background: At the joint MB/GF advisory council meeting, it was raised that salmon populations are in serious decline and are an iconic species on the west coast. Bill Douros, mentioned that perhaps the sanctuaries should weigh in and recognize that salmon are an important sanctuary resource and that we are very concerned about the current condition of the population.

- Barbara Emley and Bob Wilson from GFNMS council drafted a resolution.

Discussion: George wants to add "protection" to salmon restoration measures mentioned in the first – "Be it further resolved" paragraph. Liza supports the sanctuaries playing a larger role with salmon in the ocean. Could a more proactive element be added to the resolution? Ex: should the sanctuaries do monitoring? There is a NOAA west coast initiative to provide education about salmon; it is difficult to monitor salmon in the ocean; add language to the resolution regarding protection/monitoring of ocean phase. Salmonid protection should be brought back to the SACs agenda; invite watershed experts to the meeting.

Joint Session with Gulf of Farallones and Cordell Bank Sanctuary Advisory Councils

Lunch

Welcome

CBNMS Advisory Council Chair, Lance Morgan, called the meeting to order at 1:15pm
Introductions of GFNMS and CBNMS council members, staff, and public

Enforcement Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update (Dayna Matthews)

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for CBNMS and GFNMS met on April 7, 2010. Topics discussed included:

- i. Joint Enforcement Agreement – The office of Law Enforcement provided funds to the state of California (CA) for law enforcement; Sanctuary funding is focused on implementing the north – central marine protected area (MPA) regulations.
- ii. Mavericks Surf Contest Debrief – developed a two page draft document evaluating permitting, planning logistics, etc. from the 2010 contest. Document will be reviewed by Maria Brown, GFNMS Superintendent, and finalized into a detailed plan to be presented to TAC before Mavericks Surf Contest next year.
- iii. Enforcement Statistics – document being developed to identify activities that enforcement personnel are engaged in, number of hours worked, etc. Statistics are derived from 2009 information. Goal of document is to improve the functionality of the Office of Law Enforcement and Sanctuaries.
- iv. NOAA Twin Otter – presentation from Jason Mansour, Operations officer for the West Coast Twin Otter. This is one of the 5 NOAA Twin Otter planes and is stationed in Monterey Bay from

mid October – May, the rest of the year the plane is in Alaska. The West Coast Twin Otter supports research and enforcement missions. Long term goal is to permanently station the plane in Monterey Bay.

- v. Marine Life Protection Act (MLPA) Special Closures – Buoys will soon be deployed around some of the Special Closures. The buoys will address MPA regulations and flushing of seabirds.
- vi. Draft Vessel Patrol Guide – guide is a spin off from the areal patrol guide developed by Matt Pickett, Aircraft Operations Coordinator. All four of the CA sanctuaries have a guide and the GFNMS and CBNMS guide is a joint effort. Final product will be spiral bound, printed on water and tear proof paper. Guide is not a public document.

Discussion: Is there proactive education about MPA regulations? The California Department of Fish and Game will address public education, Farallones Marine Sanctuary Association (FMSA) has received funding for boater and fishing community outreach; there is also an effort to put regulation signs at boat ramps.

GFNMS/CBNMS Climate Change Site Scenario (Lance Morgan)

- i. Joint Working Group - CBNMS council approached GFNMS council to establish a joint working group and produced a joint document that was primarily focused on science
- ii. Collaboration/Process - 2 working group staff, 2 superintendents, 17 working group members, 36 contributors total from 16 agencies, organizations and institutions, 4 in-person meetings, 3 editors (chair, coordinator, manager), 1.5 year writing and review process.
- iii. Goals - Identify impacts of climate change (CC) to habitats and biological communities along the north-central CA coast; Synopsis of the best available knowledge on observed and predicted physical and biological impacts from CC; have baseline documentation
- iv. Outline of CC site scenario: Chp. 1: Introduction, Chp. 2: Background, Chp. 3: Physical Effects of Climate Change, Chp. 4: Regional Biotic Responses, Chp. 5: Ecosystem and Community Response, Chp. 6: Multiple Ecosystem Stressors, Chp. 7: Direct Impacts on Humans, Chp. 8: Conclusions - Working Group Recommendations
- v. Working Group Recommendations:
 - 1. **Educate** – inform people (public and decision makes) to optimize decisions: Promote stewardship, conduct outreach through exhibits/visitor centers, lectures, websites
 - 2. **Put Ecosystems in Context** - link greenhouse gas emissions with marine ecosystem health: work to understand and elucidate global and local links, work with partners (regionally and globally), educate the public
 - 3. **Anticipate Change** – create policies and management strategies that are flexible to future changes: identify priority concerns, monitor the environments and populations, regular assessments, use models to anticipate change, pursue funding and collaboration
 - 4. **Mitigate impacts** – reduce manageable stressors that compromise system resiliency: Assessment of ecological goods, services, stressors, identify opportunities to reduce stressors, work with regional partners to develop ecosystem-based management
 - 5. **Adapt to change** – create policies and management strategies that are flexible to future changes: adaptive management, develop and strengthen partnerships, funding and resources
- ii. Next Steps: Public/media release of document on June 3, 2010; Upon adoption of document: formation of working group to survey CC research activities/gap analysis and develop strategies to address the 5 working group recommendations
- iii. Open discussion: waste water treatment plants and airports would be a good audience. Who is the audience for the document? The primary audience is the GFNMS and CBNMS Superintendents, secondary audience is partner natural resource managers, and tertiary

audience is the general public. The document is not written in 'scientific language' and the document release will be an e-mail/media blast for a wide audience. Another effort: Bay Area Ecosystem Climate Change Consortium. Many positive comments from council members on the layout/presentation of the document and depth of scientific information

Lance Morgan (CBNMS council chair) motions for approval of the GFNMS/CBNMS Climate Change Site Scenario, Bob Wilson (GFNMS council secretary) approves, Ed Smith (CBNMS council) seconds, all in favor.

GFNMS/CBNMS Climate Change Site Scenario unanimously approved

Site Scenario Release and 2nd Biennial Ocean Climate Summit (Kelley Higgason)

- i. CC Site Scenario public media release on June 3rd at the California Academy of Sciences (CAS) in the planetarium. Authors will be there, brief press conference with media.
- ii. 2nd Biennial Ocean Climate Summit – at CAS, only half the number of attendees than were present last time. The goal of the summit is to address climate change impacts within the San Francisco Bay Area's coast and ocean environment through effective communication of these impacts to public audiences, as well as productive dialogue and collaborations amongst local scientists, educators, and marine resource managers.

West Coast National Marine Sanctuaries Ocean Acidification Task Force (Dan Howard and Kelley Higgason)

- i. Ocean Acidification (OA) Task Force: West Coast National Marine Sanctuaries (WCNMS) task force has been developed to take lead on OA (in response to the SAC resolutions). Task Force members include 7 representatives from the west coast sanctuaries: Dave Lott (Task Force Coordinator), Dan Howard (superintendent), Laura Francis (education/outreach), Ed Bowlby (research), Kelley Higgason (resource protection), Karen Grimmer (operations), and Linda Krop (Advisory Councils).
- ii. Task Force Goals: Develop action plans for the WCNMS to move forward and address OA. So far the group has developed an outline of strategies for research and monitoring, education, resource protection, and operations, which will be reviewed by the appropriate coordinators at each sanctuary.
 - There is already a NOAA effort to address OA and within the national context there is a west coast plan. The goal of the WCNMS OA Task Force is to nest the Sanctuaries priorities into the larger NOAA plan. Sanctuaries need to be fairly aggressive to be included as part of NOAA larger plan. The NOAA plan is out in draft form.
 - Draft documents from the WCNMS OA Task Force will be provided to the advisory councils for their review and comments before finalizing.
- iii. Timeline: within the next two weeks the outline of strategies will be available for the Research Coordinators meeting; the task force will work for a 6-8 month period.

Public comment:

Jackie Dragon (Pacific Environment) In support of the proposed working group addressing the effects of vessel traffic on sanctuary resources. Working group is critical because of busy shipping lanes, ship strikes and ocean noise impacts to marine mammals. At Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (CINMS) SAC meeting, Dan Basta (ONMS director), focused on the importance of advisory councils and the work they do (such as the 14 actions regarding OA, the GF/CB CC working group, CINMS vessel impacts working group, etc.). Dan also touched on ocean acoustics and recognized that this is the next step for research (although there is limited funding). Jackie supports the power of advisory councils and

hopes that the council will move forward on establishing the joint vessel traffic working group. Pacific Environment has grants pending that could be used to support the working group. Pacific Environment is also leading trips out of the Farallones to educate the public about the need for science based information, get them in the sanctuary, and appreciate the acoustic environment in the ocean.

Spirits Wiseman (Fairfax resident) Deeply concerned about the impacts of ocean noise and supports a joint effort to focus on ocean noise in the sanctuaries

Andrea Treece (Center for Biological Diversity) Supports next agenda item for vessel traffic working group. Issues such as ocean noise, ship strikes, etc. need to be addressed to understand the impacts. The United States Coast Guard (USCG) is conducting a Port Access Route Study (PARS) for San Francisco shipping lanes and scientific information from the group could be provided to the USCG. There are a lot of people willing to work on these issues, including graduate students.

Effects of Vessel Traffic on Sanctuary Resources Joint Working Group Discussion (Lance Morgan and Bob Wilson)

A draft proposal to form a joint working group was distributed to Council members. Lance Morgan, CBNMS Council, and Bob Wilson, GFNMS Council, led a discussion on the need for this working group. It was acknowledged there are a number of working groups at GFNMS now, and resources are limited. There is interest from outside organizations to fund a coordinator position or use a graduate student for this working group. In the wildlife disturbance chapter of the GFNMS Management Plan, Strategy 3, Activities 3.1 and 3.3 talk about addressing this issue. The CBNMS Management Plan also discusses addressing acoustics. Pacific Environment sponsored a group to discuss ship strikes to whales. There are other groups that want to research this and are interested in having this working group. They understand that GFNMS can't begin additional programs, but they do need administrative support. They can get outside help for writing documents, etc. The hope would be that sanctuary staff would at least attend meetings and provide feedback. Michael Carver can represent CBNMS and they would need one representative from GFNMS also. A well balanced working group is needed, that will determine how credible the work is. Maria Brown and Dan Howard agreed they can't do more work with less money. The Councils can write a proposal to Dan Basta requesting support for this working group. It should be clearly stated what the working group will be focused on. The Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary working group had three staff members and six grad students involved. It took Stellwagen Bank National Marine Sanctuary five years to finish their plan. This is a large project.

Motion for a joint working group to be established to study the effects of vessel traffic on sanctuary resources.

Motion: Richard Charter, Conservation, GFNMS

Second: Bob Wilson, Conservation, GFNMS

Vote: Motion carried unanimously

Motion to write letter to Maria Brown and Dan Howard, with the request to forward to Dan Basta, requesting administrative support for this working group.

Motion: Barbara Emley, Maritime Activities/Commercial, GFNMS

Second: Bruce Bowser, Conservation Alternate, GFNMS

Vote: Motion carried unanimously

Salmon as a Sanctuary Resource (Barbara Emley)

Barbara Emley, GFNMS Council, presented a draft resolution to the Councils. It was noted that Bill Douros feels it may be time for sanctuaries to weigh in on the salmon decline since it is a sanctuary resource. The three key points from the salmon summit were: not enough fresh water; the need for ecosystem management; and the need for additional science. Sanctuaries could push for funding for additional research. It was noted the National Marine Fisheries Service is already doing this. It was discussed that the resolution needed to be relevant to water management agencies and the resolution needed to be more specific about what it was targeting.

Motion to send revised resolution to Maria Brown and Dan Howard to forward to appropriate state and federal agencies.

Motion: Barbara Emley, Maritime Activities/Commercial, GFNMS

Second: Richard Charter, Conservation, GFNMS

Vote: 14 in favor, 1 opposed

Member Reports

- Brenda Donald, GFNMS Council, attended the Mavericks Surf Contest safety meeting. The local surfing community does not seem to fully understand the new sanctuary regulations for motorized personal watercraft.
- Richard Charter, GFNMS Council, reported there will be no offshore oil and gas leasing in California after 2017.
- Brittany Steward thanked the council members and sanctuary staff and stated she learned a lot from all four California sanctuaries.
- Liza Crosse, CBNMS Council, reported the Cordell Foundation has been established as a 501(c)(3) to help support CBNMS. Their website is Cordellfoundation.org.
- Richard Kuehn, GFNMS Council, requested to discuss at a future meeting the proposal on the resumption of gray whale hunting that is before the International Whaling Commission. He is concerned about setting 10 year quotas based on what we don't know.
- Bruce Bowser, GFNMS Council, reported the California Coastal Commission is organizing statewide demonstrations on May 23rd on this whaling topic.

Discussion

Tom Roth stated Representative Lynn Woolsey has drafted a delegation letter asking members of Congress to sign on to a letter to the National Marine Fisheries Service to provide accurate information to International Whaling Commission. If Council members live in other districts, you can ask your members of Congress to sign on to the letter.

Meeting adjourned at 4:15pm