



CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY

Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Minutes

February, 17 2011

9:30 am – 1:45 pm

PRBO Conservation Science, Palomarin Rm.

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

Welcome

Advisory Council Chair, Lance Morgan, called the meeting to order at 9:35am

Roll Call

Members present:

Lance Morgan (Council Chair and Conservation)

George Clyde (Council Vice-Chair and Community-at-Large Marin)

Bill McMillon (Education Alt.)

John Berge (Maritime Activities Alt.)

Bill Wolpert (Community-at-Large Sonoma)

Ed Smith (Research)

Jaime Jahncke (Research Alt.)

LT Steve Arnwine (USCG Living Marine Resources Officer)

Brian Johnson (GFNMS Deputy Superintendent)

CBNMS staff:

Dan Howard (CBNMS superintendent)

Kaitlin Graiff (CBNMS Advisory Council Coordinator)

Michael Carver (Resource Protection)

Review Agenda

The agenda was unanimously approved

Review of November Minutes

The November 18, 2010 meeting minutes were approved with no changes

Lance motioned to adopt November minutes as final, Ed approved, Bill seconds, all in favor

November minutes accepted as final

Manager's Report (Dan Howard)

National Marine Sanctuary Foundation (NMSF): held their board meeting in Pt. Reyes last week. Dan presented to the NMSF board about CBNMS and Tom Lambert, President of the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation, presented to the NMSF board about the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation. Dan thanked Council members who attended the evening reception hosted by the NMSF.

West Coast Ocean Acidification Task Force: The draft ocean acidification (OA) action plan will be out soon. The plan has strategies and activities to address OA and has a similar layout to the management plan. The Council will have a chance to review the draft plan before the April 21, 2011 Council meeting.

Open Council Seats: representing Community-at-large Marin, Research, and Fishing. Current members are eligible to re-apply (application due date April 1, 2011). National Marine Fisheries representative, Dayna Mathews, will not be able to attend all scheduled meetings due to limited travel funds.

FY11 Budget: Expecting a 5% cut from FY10 budget. The House of Representatives has proposed an 18% budget cut for NOAA. Brian Johnson said that Gulf of Farallones is trying to obtain funding from the San Francisco America's Cup (George Clyde has put them in touch with potential funders).

Sanctuary Expansion Bill has been reintroduced to the Senate.

- George asked about NOAA's aquaculture policy that is open for review and if Council members should respond. Dan answered: Cordell Bank regulations prohibit any permanent anchoring to seafloor; which could be needed for aquaculture infrastructure. This would eliminate consideration for putting an offshore aquaculture facility within the CBNMS boundaries. Lance mentioned that there are proposals to drift fish pens in currents. Dan could provide NOAA's aquaculture policy if anyone wanted to look at it.

- John asked about the proposed north coast wave energy project. Sonoma water agency had interest in putting in three different technologies. They had permits in place, but no funding for the cable to transfer energy.

Research Report (Kaitlin Graiff)

- i. CBNMS's proposal to conduct deep sea coral research in Bodega Canyon (an area within the potential expansion area) in 2011 was accepted by the NOAA Coral Reef Conservation Program. Results from this work could provide vital information regarding an unexplored canyon system and provide data to compare with other well-studied canyons in the region. The area is currently open to trawling; however, fishing effort data suggest that it is an area of lower trawl intensity. Bodega Canyon is not currently an EFH conservation area and could be a candidate for new designation as part of the EFH review process. This project will be a collaboration with Dr. Elizabeth Clarke of NOAA Fisheries-Northwest Fisheries Science Center as well as Guy Cochrane of USGS-Santa Cruz. The team plans to use an autonomous underwater vehicle (AUV) to conduct a broad-scale characterization of deep sea coral/sponge habitats and communities in Bodega Canyon using still camera observations. The objective is to assess the abundance, distribution, and habitat associations of corals and sponges, as well as associated fish and invertebrates, over a broad region of the Canyon.
- ii. ACCESS (Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies) partners will be meeting with sanctuary resource protection staff in March to discuss ways that information collected as part of ACCESS can meet the needs of GFNMS and CBNMS resource protection programs. The group will discuss current and emerging issues that could benefit from the ACCESS program and develop ideas on ways to present the information in the most effective manner.
- iii. CBNMS staff are continuing to work on logistics related to conducting the ACCESS (Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies) program in 2011. Due to budget shortfalls, the planned sampling area for 2011 will be a reduction from the 2010 effort. The group plans to conduct the research cruises off of the R/V John Martin and the R/V Fulmar. The group is hoping to have another Teacher at Sea participate in 2011. There is also the possibility of having graduate students and interns participate in the research cruises.
- iv. Staff from CBNMS continue to work on activities related to the October 2010 SCUBA mission to Cordell Bank aboard the R/V Fulmar. A cruise report was completed that describes how divers collected samples to be archived and identified by the California Academy of Sciences and photos/videos were collected to document and characterize the habitat and communities of the upper reaches of the Bank. The report includes representative photos of the reef crest community. Scientists at California Academy of Sciences continue to identify the samples that

were collected by the divers and are amazed at the quality of the samples. The Academy's Invertebrate Zoology collection now has almost 1000 specimens from Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary.

- v. In December 2010, Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary facilitated the donation of a collection of more than 3,000 underwater color photographs (35 mm transparencies) of Cordell Bank to the California Academy of Sciences (CAS) in San Francisco. The donation was made by the independent research group Cordell Expeditions (CE) who took the photographs during SCUBA dives on Cordell Bank between 1977 and 1986. The photographs complement the collection of biological specimens which CE gifted to CAS in 2009. CAS intends to digitally scan all of the images and make selected images available via the online Manzanita Image Project. The photo collections have both scientific and historical significance to the sanctuary since these collections provided the basis for the designation of Cordell Bank as a National Marine Sanctuary. The photos and specimens provide the sanctuary with a retrospective window into the condition of Cordell Bank at the time of its designation and will be used for comparison with contemporary images taken at some of the same dive sites during October 2010.
- vi. CBNMS staff continue to work on analyzing video data of deep sea coral communities and habitats from the 2010 McArthur II research cruise.

Resource Protection (Michael Carver)

- i. NOAA Twin Otter Aircraft: trying to develop a monitoring program with California sanctuaries, however budget and personnel shortfalls are limiting our ability to initiate new programs. We may end up donating air time to the Channel Islands for their ongoing monitoring program.
- ii. United States Coast Guard (USCG) Port Access Route Study (PARS):
 - a. Reviewed timeline of process: notice of PARS study: December 2009; Comments due: February 2010; Notice of public meetings: September 2010; Meeting held: October 2010; NMS provided USCG with data and discussed lane alternatives; Final PARS report: June 2011.
 - b. Data to be analyzed for developing traffic lane alternative includes: vessel traffic trends, fishing activities, recreational boating, military activities, environmental factors, economic impact, present & potential traffic density
 - c. Michael presented an interactive PDF displaying the multiple data layers and traffic lane alternatives. In June 2011, the USCG will recommend their choice for best alternative.
 - d. Group Discussion: Lance Morgan expressed his concern that the end of the northern traffic lane is in the vicinity of Bodega Canyon which can be a cetacean hotspot. Michael commented that once the recommended traffic lanes from the USCG are announced, they will seek additional comments from the public. John Berge said that the opinion of the shipping industry is that they will comply with any alternative. The USCG was concerned with limiting the number of traffic lanes into the convergence zone, so there will still be three lanes. Teri Shore, Turtle Island Restoration Network, stressed that the consideration of Pacific leather back sea turtle habitat should be considered for the PARS. John pointed out that there is a miss perception that the traffic lanes are busy with ship traffic like "high-speed freeways". Bill Wolpert asked if whale distribution was in predictable areas. To address this question, Jaime presented a map of Humpback whale distribution from 2005-2010 to show that their distribution was mostly along the shelf break and near the Farallon Islands in the west bound traffic lane. Bill Wolpert also asked if multiple species of whales (Humpback, Blue and Gray) are equally at risk for ship strikes. Dan Howard answered that there is evidence that Blue whales rest on the

surface at night increasing their vulnerability and John Berge added that it is harder for ships to see whales at night.

Session ran until 1050, Break until 1100

Vessel impacts working group update (Lance Morgan)

The vessel impacts working group will focus on ship strikes to marine mammals and ocean noise. Invitations for working group participants have been sent out. Timeline: start meeting this spring, have 4-5 meetings in one year. The working group will introduce their recommendations/report to the Cordell Bank and Gulf of Farallones Advisory council for their approval to be forwarded to sanctuary superintendents Dan Howard and Maria Brown.

Vessel spills working group (Dan Howard)

The Gulf of the Farallones Advisory Council will take the lead running the vessel spills working group. Dan put out the request to the Cordell Bank Council for their approval to participate in the vessel spill working group to make it a joint working group. The goal of the group is to focus on vessel spills and different response technologies. The group will likely devote time to considering the application of dispersants in the sanctuary. The USCG is pre-approved for dispersant application in federal waters, but they are required to consult with sanctuary superintendents before applying within sanctuaries. The plan developed by the working group will likely include updated information and lessons learned from the Deep Water Horizon oil spill response. Jaime asked how the ERMA (Environmental Response Management Application) and working groups converge. Brian Johnson answered that the data layers from the ERMA could be applied to the decision process/tool the working group develops. The meeting schedule would be about 3-4 meetings in one year.

Lance Morgan motions that the Cordell Bank Council joins the Vessel Spill working group, Bill McMillion approves, all in favor.

Lance asked for volunteers to participate on the working group as Cordell Bank Council chair. Council members asked of meeting schedule/timeline and other details about the working group. Brian Johnson will get more information after the lunch break.

Public Comment

Teri Shore, Turtle Island Restoration Network, is very interested in the vessel impacts working group and would be interested in attending the meetings as a member of the public. She also mentioned that the Environmental Protection Agency has designated a law banning all sewage discharges from large cruise ships and most other large ocean-going ships in the marine waters along California's entire coastline. Also, critical habitat off the US West coast for the endangered Leatherback sea turtle could be expanded. She is going to suggest that Todd propose to the Council to pass a resolution in support of expanding critical habitat for leatherbacks.

Air Resource Board regulations and commercial vessel use of the San Francisco traffic separation scheme (John Berge)

- Air Resources Board (ARB) began enforcement of rule regulating fuel usage in main engines on July 1, 2009. 0.5% or less sulfur content within 24 nautical miles (nm) of shore. Radius extended outside of Farallon Islands but not outside of Channel Islands.

- Cost and performance penalties for using this fuel. Typical sulfur content for residual fuel on the West Coast has been ~2.5%.
- Cost differential between residual and distillate fuel ranges from 60% to double.
- Resulted in a shift in traffic patterns in California – coastwise vessels sought traffic lanes outside 24 nm.
 - o For LA/Long Beach, coastwise vessels shifted from the Santa Barbara Channel to outside of the Channel Islands.
 - o For San Francisco, vessels shifted from South & North lanes to Western lane.
- Stats for San Francisco traffic lanes:
 - o Three year average of 613 vessels per month (2008-2010); Range of 463 – 689 vessels. Equates to an average of 20 arrivals and departures per day.
 - o Prior to July 2009, traffic pattern for lane usage:
 - South 36% - 220/month – 7/day
 - West 35% - 214/month – 7/day
 - North 29% - 178/month – 6/day
 - o After July 2009, traffic pattern for lane usage:
 - South 26% - 159/month – 5/day
 - West 50% - 307/month – 10/day
 - North 24% - 147/month – 5 day
- August 2012, The North American Emission Control Area (ECA) adopted by the International Maritime Organization (IMO), US and Canada will extend to 200 nm from shore –hopefully Mexico will still join.
- Initial ECA requirement is for 1.0% sulfur maximum in August, 2012.
- ARB Rule shifts to 0.1% sulfur maximum on January 1, 2012.
- ECA requirement shifts to 0.1% on January 1, 2015. ARB rule would sunset on that date.
 - o So until 2015, there is no clear indication of how vessels will react and comply with the two competing rules.
 - Vessels may carry 3 types of fuel – normal residual fuel, 1.0% residual and 0.1% distillate
 - Vessels may blend normal residual and distillate between 200 nm and 24 nm, although problematic for a number of reasons
 - Vessel may choose to consume 0.1% distillate for the entire 200nm from January 2012 onwards.
- As things settle, there is an expectation that that re-routing that has occurred will shift back to more normal distributions.
- (Data sources: number of vessel arrivals and departures is from the San Francisco Marine Exchange. Percentage of vessels using each traffic lane is from the United States Coast Guard Vessel Traffic Service. Vessel size over 300 gross tons)

Broke for lunch at 1200. Essential Fish Habitat discussion will take place after lunch.

Five Year Essential Fish Habitat (EFH) review by the Pacific Fisheries Management Council (PFMC) (Dan Howard)

Dan displayed a map of the West Coast EFH closure areas and explained the type of prohibitions associated with different EFH zones. He highlighted that EFH areas that prohibit the use of bottom contact gear are only found on two seamounts, President Jackson and Thompson Seamount, and over Cordell Bank. In 2006, the PFMC designated an EFH conservation area prohibiting the use of bottom

contact gear over Cordell Bank. Now in 2011, the PFMC has initiated the process of reviewing established EFH areas and considering other areas as potential EFH. Lisa Wooninck from the West Coast region is attending the PFMC review meetings. CBNMS staff will be summarizing the data from the 2010 deep sea coral cruise in a report to provide to the PFMC for the EFH review. Olympic Coast NMS is recommending that new areas within the sanctuary be established as EFH.

-Marine Conservation Biology Institute (MCBI) is creating a database that maps corals on West coast.

Member Reports

Brian Johnson – update on vessel spills working group: there will be about 6 meetings over 1 year. Current working group members from the Gulf of Farallones council are Patrick Rutten, Barbara Emley, and Richard Charter. Goals of group will be to address recommendations for oil spill response tools such as in situ burning and use of dispersants.

Jaime Jahncke, Cordell Bank Advisory Council research alt., volunteered to be the Cordell Bank Council representative on the vessel spills working group.

Jaime Jahncke: Working on an Environmental Response Management Application (ERMA) to assist emergency responders in central California from Bodega Bay to Half Moon Bay. ERMA is like an open source GIS tool that has multiple layers of ecosystem and human use data accessible for conservation and management response to crisis events (such as oil spills). An ERMA was developed for the Deep Water Horizon spill in the Gulf of Mexico.

LT Steve Arnwine: On March 16th Michael Carver and Karen Reyna will be refreshing Coast Guard on Sanctuary regulations at air station Sacramento. In May, Steve will be re-stationed in Florida and Elisa Garrity will be filling his position on the advisory council.

George Clyde: In response to a comment by Bill McMillion about a youth seat on the Council, he suggested that each of the council members bring a kid with them to a Council meeting. The invitation could be sent to the school kids in Vic Chow's program. The meeting could be more "kid-friendly". In response to his concern about not including Tomales Bay in the NMS low over flight regulations, George received dozens of letters of support from individuals and organizations to have Tomales Bay added to the low over flight regulations. The regulations state that aircraft flying under 1000 ft over designated sensitive areas are presumed to have disturbed marine mammals and seabirds. Current zones include Bolinas Lagoon, Farallon Islands, Bird Rock and Point Reyes but not Tomales Bay.

Ed Smith: has been attending meetings that primarily focus on how state and national budget cuts will affect multiple agencies that rely on each other for funding projects and how to work around these issues. Herring have come back in San Francisco Bay and they are spawning in areas that were once historic spawning areas. They aren't sure the cause for the shift in spawning areas; there has been no direct correlation to oil.

Lance Morgan: In response to NOAA's commitment to Marine Spatial Planning as a product of the National Ocean Policy, Lance, Jaime and Sarah Maxwell (MCBI) submitted a proposal to identify and define areas of ecological importance (benthic and pelagic) as addressed in the plan for Marine Spatial Planning. Lance will be attending the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS) meeting in Washington, DC. Lance has also been working with Michael Carver and staff from Gulf of the Farallones to obtain funding for a workshop that will bring together law enforcement, management and research divisions of various agencies with the shared goal of protecting MPA resources. His son's

school was given a B-WET grant and Lance went to the school talked to the kids about National Marine Sanctuaries

Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation (Tom Lambert)

- 7 out of the 14 National Marine Sanctuaries have a friends group. The newest friends group is at Thunder Bay National Marine Sanctuary.

Overview of the Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation:

Board of Directors: Tom Lambert (President), Peter Edwards (CFO), Susan Williams (Secretary), David McGuire, Bob Van Syoc, Liza Crosse, Dan Howard (Ex Officio).

Mission: The Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation is dedicated to supporting the research, education and conservation programs of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary and increasing public awareness of the Sanctuary.

The Foundation obtained 501 (c)(3) status on April 30, 2009.

Top Priority project the foundation is raising funds for is a submersible research project at Cordell Bank to compare current ecological conditions to those documented in 2002.

Meeting Adjourned at 2:00 pm